The Effectiveness of the Illusion of Choice

A Project Presented to the Faculty of The Guildhall at Southern Methodist University
By David Gerald Saunders
(B.S. Mathematics, Seattle University, 2004)

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for a Masters of Interactive Technology in Digital Game Development with a Specialization in Level Design

August 9th, 2010
To the Graduate Faculty:

I am submitting herewith a project written by David Gerald Saunders entitled “The Effectiveness of the Illusion of Choice.” I recommend that it be accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Interactive Technology in Digital Game Development, with Specialization in Level Design.

_______________________________
Carl Sanford Petersen, Guildhall Faculty Supervisor

I have read this Project
and recommend its acceptance:

_______________________________
Michael McCoy, Guildhall Faculty Advisor

Accepted for the Faculty:

_______________________________
Gary Brubaker, Deputy Director of Academics
SMU Guildhall
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study would not have been possible without the support of countless students, professors, colleagues, friends, and family, many of which I have listed below.

Tracie, who stood by me through thick and thin, and who constantly strove to ensure I was the best I could be. I wouldn’t be here without you.

My parents, who encouraged me to take risks and follow my dreams.

Tyler Buser, who served active duty with me in the Guildhall trenches and who spent countless sleepless nights keeping me laughing.

Toby McCall, who made sure I didn’t overextend myself, and who always inspired.

Professor Sandy Petersen, for providing invaluable feedback and just generally being awesome.

Professor Mike McCoy, for being a happy rock in the midst of a stormy sea. A champion indeed.

Jonathan Mintz, who’s deep understanding of player choice and what makes games tick only served to make this a much stronger thesis.

To all, thank you so so so much.
As technology grows and game systems become more complex, the ability for players to meaningfully determine the direction of story and player progression becomes ever more sought after. However, this freedom comes at a cost – every new player choice requires additional art assets, voice recordings, or other forms of expensive manpower. The Illusion of Choice gives designers a way to create the impression of large, complex worlds, without the huge cost of doing so.

This project first looks at ways in which designers can use the Illusion of Choice to give players a meaningful experience. Then it explores how effective these methods are at giving players the sense of agency they crave. Twenty two testers played a level in the Fallout 3 (G.E.C.K.) game engine created specifically to test the Illusion of Choice. The hypothesis for the project was that players could indeed be fooled by the Illusion of Choice.

Throughout the level, players encountered numerous dialogue and path choices. Ultimately, regardless of any of the choices players made, the outcome of each choice was the same. All the dialogue responses were the same, all the treasure choices gave the same rewards, and all the paths lead to the same place.

The study was successful in identifying a number of instances where using the Illusion of Choices was effective, though it also pointed out a number of instances where...
players easily saw through the Illusion of Choice. When players receive positive rewards, they are much less likely to question whether or not they have been tricked. Conversely, when players receive negative rewards, they are much more likely to question the outcome of their results. Additionally, players are more often able to see through the Illusion of Choice in instances where it is used in a detectable pattern.

What the study did not hypothesize was the strength of the correlation between player type and the ability to be fooled by the Illusion of Choice. Those players who tend to like games with multiple choices were much less likely to be fooled than those players who tend to play those types of games less frequently. Those players who would rather run and gun than spend time worrying about the consequences of their choices were much more likely to be fooled by the Illusion of Choice. These findings leave plenty of room for further investigation into this topic.
# Table of Contents

List of Figures ................................................................................................................... viii  
Nomenclature ..................................................................................................................... x  
Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................................................................... 1  
Chapter 2: Review ........................................................................................................... 3  
  2:1 Literature Review ....................................................................................................... 3  
    2:1:1 Types of False Choice – High Level ................................................................. 4  
    2:1:2 Types of False Choice – Axis of Influence .................................................... 5  
    2:1:3 The Designer’s Perspective on False Choice .................................................. 6  
  2:3 Field Review – Fable 2 ........................................................................................... 8  
  2:4 Field Review – Bioshock ....................................................................................... 10  
  2:5 Field Review – Dragon Age ............................................................................... 12  
  2:6 Summary ............................................................................................................... 14  
Chapter 3: Methodology .................................................................................................. 15  
  3:1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 15  
  3:2 The Product ........................................................................................................... 16  
    3:2:1 Quick Summary ............................................................................................... 16  
    3:2:2 In Depth .......................................................................................................... 16  
    3:2:3 Visual References ............................................................................................ 32  
    3:2:4 Rough Maps .................................................................................................. 40  
  3:3 Data Sources .......................................................................................................... 45  
  3:4 Data Collection and Procedures ........................................................................... 46  
  3:5 Data Analysis ......................................................................................................... 47  
Chapter 4: Results and Analysis ....................................................................................... 48  
  4:1 Demographics ......................................................................................................... 48  
    4:1:1 Age and Sex ................................................................................................. 48  
    4:1:2 Hours Spent Gaming Per Week ................................................................ 49  
    4:1:3 Tester Favorite Genres .................................................................................. 50  
    4:1:4 Tester Bartle Personality Types .................................................................. 51  
    4:1:5 Tester Reasons for Choosing Paths in Games ............................................. 52  
  4:2 Post Play Survey Results ....................................................................................... 53  
    4:2:1 General Tester Experience .......................................................................... 53  
    4:2:2 Tester Experience by Player Type ................................................................. 54  
    4:2:3 Tester Experience - Achievers .................................................................... 55  
    4:2:4 Tester Experience - Explorers .................................................................... 56  
    4:2:5 Tester Experience - Killers .......................................................................... 57  
  4:3 Correlations ............................................................................................................ 58  
    4:3:1 Correlations of Interest in Story Outcome .................................................... 58  
    4:3:2 Correlations of Immersion ............................................................................ 59  
    4:3:3 Correlations of Preferring Dialogue Choices ............................................. 60  
    4:3:4 Correlations of Preferring Path Choices ..................................................... 61  
    4:3:5 Correlations of the Feeling of Many Choices ............................................. 62  

David Gerald Saunders vi August 9th, 2010
Appendix A

Chapter 5: Conclusion

4:3:6 Correlations of Testers Feeling They Had an Impact .................................................. 63
4:3:7 Correlations of Guardian Appropriate Response ....................................................... 64
4:4 Data on Choices ............................................................................................................. 65
4:4:1 All Tester Information ............................................................................................... 65
4:4:2 Achiever Choice Data ............................................................................................... 68
4:4:3 Explorer Choice Data ............................................................................................... 69
4:4:4 Killer Choice Data .................................................................................................... 70
4:5 Data Analysis Conclusions & Interpretation ................................................................. 70
4:5:1 Where the Illusion of Choice Failed .......................................................................... 70
4:5:2 Where the Illusion of Choice Succeeded .................................................................. 71
4:5:3 Data Analysis Conclusion ....................................................................................... 72

References .......................................................................................................................... 78
Books ................................................................................................................................. 78
Articles ............................................................................................................................... 78
Games ............................................................................................................................... 78

Appendix A – Survey Results ............................................................................................. 79
Tester 1 ............................................................................................................................... 79
Tester 2 ............................................................................................................................... 83
Tester 3 ............................................................................................................................... 88
Tester 4 ............................................................................................................................... 93
Tester 5 ............................................................................................................................... 98
Tester 6 ................................................................................................................................ 102
Tester 7 ................................................................................................................................ 107
Tester 8 ................................................................................................................................ 112
Tester 9 ................................................................................................................................ 116
Tester 10 ............................................................................................................................ 121
Tester 11 ............................................................................................................................ 126
Tester 12 ............................................................................................................................ 130
Tester 13 ............................................................................................................................ 135
Tester 14 ............................................................................................................................ 140
Tester 15 ............................................................................................................................ 145
Tester 16 ............................................................................................................................ 150
Tester 17 ............................................................................................................................ 155
Tester 18 ............................................................................................................................ 160
Tester 19 ............................................................................................................................ 165
Tester 20 ............................................................................................................................ 170
Tester 21 ............................................................................................................................ 174
Tester 22 ............................................................................................................................ 179
List of Figures

Figure 1: Fable 2 markets itself as a game about player choice ................................................... 8
Figure 2: The main character’s appearance changes based on the choices the player makes ... 9
Figure 3: Bioshock’s choices largely surround those of morality .................................................. 10
Figure 4: From the very beginning of Dragon Age, players have a number of choices which greatly effect the way the game plays out ................................................................. 12
Figure 5: There are typically a number of dialogue choices in DAO for any given conversation, each of which may lead to a different conclusion ................................................. 13
Figure 6: Guardian 1 - Nuka Lurk Model ...................................................................................... 32
Figure 7: Guardian 2 - Yao Guai Model ......................................................................................... 32
Figure 8: Guardian 3 - Dog Model ................................................................................................. 33
Figure 9: Hermit Model Concept ................................................................................................ 33
Figure 10: Enemy Ghoul Model .................................................................................................. 34
Figure 11: Enemy Radroach Model ............................................................................................. 34
Figure 12: Enemy Mole Rat Model ............................................................................................... 35
Figure 13: Cave Reference 1 ........................................................................................................ 35
Figure 14: Cave Reference 2 ........................................................................................................ 36
Figure 15: Cave Reference 3 ........................................................................................................ 36
Figure 16: Cave Reference 4 ........................................................................................................ 37
Figure 17: Cave Reference 5 ........................................................................................................ 37
Figure 18: Cave Reference 6 ........................................................................................................ 38
Figure 19: Cave Reference 7 ........................................................................................................ 38
Figure 20: Cave Reference 8 ........................................................................................................ 39
Figure 21: Rough Floor 1 Map (Overhead) .................................................................................. 40
Figure 22: Rough Floor 1 Map (Perspective) ................................................................................ 41
Figure 23: Rough Floor 2 Map (Overhead) .................................................................................. 42
Figure 24: Rough Floor 2 Map (Perspective) ................................................................................ 43
Figure 25: Rough Floor 3 Map (Overhead) .................................................................................. 44
Figure 26: Rough Floor 3 Map (Perspective) ................................................................................ 45
Figure 27: Number and % of Testers by Gender ....................................................................... 48
Figure 28: Testers by Age ............................................................................................................ 48
Figure 29: Hours Spent Gaming Per Week .................................................................................. 49
Figure 30: Tester Favorite Genres ............................................................................................... 50
Figure 31: Bartle Personality Types .............................................................................................. 51
Figure 32: Reason for Choosing Paths in Games .......................................................................... 52
Figure 33: Playtester Experience Feedback - Total ...................................................................... 53
Figure 34: Playtester Experience Feedback - by Player Type ...................................................... 54
Figure 35: The Experience of Achievers ...................................................................................... 55
Figure 36: The Experience of Explorers ...................................................................................... 56
Figure 37: The Experience of Killers ............................................................................................ 57
Figure 38: Correlation - Story Outcome ...................................................................................... 58
Figure 39: Correlation - Immersion ............................................................................................. 59
Figure 40: Correlation - Dialogue Choice Preference .................................................................... 60
Figure 41: Correlation - Path Choice Preference .......................................................................... 61
Figure 42: Correlation - Feeling They Had Choices ................................................................. 62
Figure 43: Correlation - Feeling They Had an Impact ............................................................... 63
Figure 44: Correlation - Believing Guardians Responded Appropriately ............................. 64
Figure 45: Choices - All Testers ............................................................................................... 65
Figure 46: Tester Recall of Story Post Play .............................................................................. 65
Figure 47: Player Gun Choices ............................................................................................... 66
Figure 48: Player Treasure Choices .......................................................................................... 66
Figure 49: Player Door Choice ................................................................................................. 67
Figure 50: Door Choice Perception .......................................................................................... 67
Figure 51: Achiever Choices .................................................................................................... 68
Figure 52: Explorer Choices .................................................................................................... 69
Figure 53: Killer Choices ......................................................................................................... 70
Nomenclature

Achiever is one of the Bartle player profile types. Achievers are interested in mastering one or more aspects of the game. Achievers are proud of their status as top-tier players of the game.

Correlation is a statistical relation between two or more variables such that changes in the value of one variable results in changes in the other. In other words, correlation is a statistical measure of how closely two variables affect each other.

Dialogue Options are in-game events where the player chooses how they wish their character to respond or react to a given situation. Typically, these events consist of dialogue between the player and the characters in the game.

Explorer is one of the Bartle player profile types. Explorers are interested in discovering the game world and experiencing all the surprises it has to offer. Explorers are proud to be knowledgeable about the games they play.

SMU Guildhall is a video game-focused graduate program at Southern Methodist University.

The Illusion of Choice occurs where the designer gives the player a choice, such as choosing between dialogue options, traversing different paths, or other methods, where the outcome of that choice has no significant effect on the gameplay or overall narrative.

Immersion refers to the participant’s suspension of disbelief while playing the game. Typically, the more the participant becomes engrossed in the game, the more immersed they are.

Killer is one of the Bartle player profile types. Killers are interested in demonstrating their superiority over other players or characters in the game world. They are proud of their fighting skills.

A Meaningful Choice is a choice which meaningfully affects the cost of the final product. For example, being able to choose between a sand level and a snow level would meaningfully affect how many art assets need to be put into the game.

A Modified Bartle Test is a series of psychological questions which attempts to bucket players into one of three categories – Achiever, Explorer, and Killer. Richard Bartle defined his Bartle Player Types in his work “Hearts, Clubs, Diamonds, Spades: Players Who Suit MUDs.” The Modified Bartle Test is differentiated from a standard Bartle Test only in that it asks fewer questions and doesn’t take into account the Socializer player type.
Chapter 1: Introduction

Today, video games offer players unprecedented access to personal storytelling in a way which movies, television shows, radio, and the written word have only dreamed of. As technology grows and the systems in games become ever greater and more complex, the ability for players to meaningfully determine the direction of story and player progression becomes ever more sought after. Open world games, like Grand Theft Auto IV (Rockstar Games, 2008) or Oblivion (Bethesda Softworks, 2006) offer players large worlds in which players explore locations in almost any order they wish. Games such as Dragon Age (Bioware, 2009) and Fallout 3 (Bethesda Softworks, 2008) offer players complex dialogue options which can, many times, drastically alter the course of both the story and the gameplay.

Developing games with complex worlds or complex dialogue options can be tremendously expensive. Each new reaction designers give to a player’s action may require new assets such as voice recordings, animations, levels, characters, weapons, or anything else related to the option.

The Illusion of Choice occurs where the designer gives the player a choice, such as choosing between dialogue options, traversing different paths, or other methods, where the outcome of that choice has no significant effect on the gameplay or overall narrative. This thesis tests where the Illusion of Choice in video games is effective and where it is not. It explores this through giving players multiple dialogue and path choices that all lead to the same conclusion, and identifying where the Illusion of Choice was successful in making players feel that they had a meaningful impact upon the game.
The study gives testers a level built in *Fallout 3*. The player has numerous choices surrounding dialogue options, paths, and itemization. Regardless of the player’s choices, they always get the same result.

The purpose of this study is to determine to what degree the Illusion of Choice gives the player a richer experience, where the Illusion of Choice works best, and in what cases it works poorly. Its secondary purpose is to understand how the Illusion of Choice affects the player’s sense of immersion, the player’s sense of agency, and the player’s ability to remember the story of the overall narrative. Participants of the study played a level containing multiple uses of the Illusion of Choice and filled out a questionnaire regarding their experience. Regardless of the player’s actions, none of the choices have any meaningful consequences on either story or gameplay.

Despite this study’s successes, there is ample room for further investigation into the topic. Since the study only takes into account a single game engine, one cannot assume the principles learned in the study apply to other game engines, although the engine does share similar qualities of NPC interaction and special navigation with other engines. Furthermore, the sample size of the study is relatively small, and thus, the respondents may not be representative of an entire population. Finally, the study was conducted using only SMU Guildhall students that identified themselves as “gamers”, which may not be representative of an entire population. Indeed, the conclusions of this study ask as many questions as they answer, and open the doors for numerous other future studies.
Chapter 2: Review

As games become more complex, players expect an ever greater array of player choice, open world navigation, and choice-laden narrative. While game designers can provide players with a near infinite number of complex possibilities, doing so is prohibitively expensive in terms of asset creation. This thesis explores the methods for and effects of providing the Illusion of Choice to the player as an alternative to providing the player with significant ability to alter the game flow. This offers developers a method of providing players the impression of non-linear gameplay without having to go through a costly development process.

2:1 Literature Review

There is little scientific work on the illusion of player choice in video games. There have been some attempts at categorizing the types of illusionary choices players have, as well as some theoretical work on the consequences these different types of illusionary choices produce. Written discourse on these topics are available through searches in Ebsco, Academic OneFile, Google Scholar, and Google. Amazon.com offers books on the topics.

We will first look at different types of false choice we can offer the player. Then we will explore what David Perry and Jesse Schell, both game designers, have to say regarding the use of false choice in games. Finally, we will look at three games which critics consider paragons of choice – Fable 2 (Lionhead Studios, 2008), Bioshock (2K Games, 2007), and Dragon Age:Origins (Bioware, 2009) – and how they use false choice differently.
2:1:1 Types of False Choice – High Level

L. B. Jefferies, in his article *Illusionary Choices in Games* (2009) argues that there are three types of false choices that games can offer. The first type of false choice relates to situations where the player is unable to make an informed decision due to a general lack of information. In a post on free will, blogger Islaskye discusses this outlook by arguing that “in the absence of the fullest details about the consequences of the choices to be made; and without verifiable information about the reality of the options apparently available to you, freedom of choice is just an illusion.” (Islaskye 2007). This type of false choice occurs most often when a game asks the player to make a choice, yet gives them no information as to the consequences of this choice. An example of this would be a situation where the player can choose between a red door and a blue door. If the player has no idea what is or may be behind either of the doors, the choice is effectively one of randomness on the part of the player, but may be interpreted as adding agency to the player’s actions. By asking the player to make a decision without giving the player the information to make an informed decision, designers can provide the player with a single outcome regardless of the player’s choice and the player will never know. The player feels they are making a decision all their own, thus providing the player the feeling of agency.

The second type of illusionary choice occurs when a player makes a choice, but the consequences become invalidated by the storyline or gameplay. An example of this occurs on a gameplay level in the game *Bioshock* (2K Games, 2007). The player has the choice whether to kill evil children and harvest their resources for extra experience, or set them free and forego the experience. In the end, the game makes up for the “lost” experience by providing the player with more experience from other tasks, effectively making the player’s
progression the same regardless if they choose to destroy the children or not. In this situation, the player feels they are making meaningful choices, but the game invalidates that choice through behind-the-scenes mechanics. It should be noted that in *Bioshock*, harvesting the children does have an effect on the game’s end cut scene, so this example is only illusionary in regards to the game’s mechanics.

The third type of illusionary choice occurs when a player chooses between two things that provide essentially the same outcome but are presented slightly differently. *Gears of War (Epic Games, 2006)* uses this type of choice extensively. In *Gears of War*, the player overtly chooses between two routes, although in most situations the player ends up fighting similar enemies in similar environments. In *Gears of War*, both paths lead to the same location.

### 2:1:2 Types of False Choice – Axis of Influence

We can go on to break down types of false choice to a more specifically applied to games: narrative choices, systemic choices, spatial choices, and cosmetic choices. Narrative choices affect the way the story plays out but do not affect the way the game plays. These types of choices can affect the outcome of the story as a whole or the outcome of a side-story or mission. For example, when players decide to harvest the demon children in *Bioshock* they get a different ending than those players who do not harvest the children.

Systemic choices affect the way the game’s resources are affected. Systemic choices may lead to resource bonuses or restrictions. In the game *Fable 2* (Lionhead Studios, 2008), players have the ability to own real estate in the local town. If they decide to be corrupt and raise rents significantly, the player will get more income from their properties but the town will start to become unkempt and local merchants will be forced to close their shops. If the
player decides to reduce rent, the player forgoes the extra money but the town will flourish. This is an example of a systemic choice.

Spatial choices affect where the player can travel during the game. In *Gears of War*, the player has an option between one of two paths. If they choose one path, they cannot travel along the other. This is an example of a spatial choice.

Cosmetic choices affect only the way the game looks, not the way it plays or acts. In *Fable 2*, players can buy different clothes from different shops and change the way the player dresses. These objects don’t affect gameplay in any way, but they give the player a sense of ownership around their character. Cosmetic choices are a way for players to visually express themselves and, for many players, make up some of the most important choices of all.

2:1:3 The Designer’s Perspective on False Choice

David Perry, in his book *David Perry on Game Design: A Brainstorming ToolBox* (Perry, 2009), argues that the players feel a greater sense of freedom when they have more options. He says that “choice is arguably the biggest factor in enhancing the sense of freedom. The more options players have, within limits of course, and the more choices players have when exploring those options, the freer they will feel.” (Perry, 2009)

Perry goes on to argue that designers must use deliberation when deciding which types of choices to give to the player, and that offering numerous “choices and options [do] not necessarily make the game feel freer. The choices and options should enhance the gameplay, not add complexity for complexity’s sake. In addition, choices must be meaningful. The choices a player makes must each have a different effect on the game or situation, or at least the player’s responses.” (Perry, 2009)
The crux of his argument, however, lies in player perception. Ultimately, he argues that if players believe they are making meaningful choices, that is all that matters. He says that regardless of whether or not two items function in exactly the same way, if one is, say, aesthetically more pleasing to a player, the player will feel like they have made a meaningful choice. Perry makes no comments as to why he believes his claims.

Jesse Schell, in his book *The Art of Game Design: A Book of Lenses* (Schell, 2007), takes a slightly different view. Schell emphasizes that “a good game gives the player meaningful choices. Not just any choices, but choices that will have a real impact on what happens next, and how the game turns out. Many designers fall into the trap of offering the player meaningless choices.” (Schell, 2007)

Most importantly, Schell’s book gives an indication of how many choices designers should give to a player. He states that a player’s desire directly relates to the number of choices the player is willing to accept before becoming overwhelmed. His suggestion is for developers to determine the number of things which the player wishes to do in a given situation, and then give the player that number of choices. He gives the example that a single fork in the road is far less daunting than 30 forks in the road, but when it comes to personal expression, such as clothing in *The Sims* (Maxis, 2000), players want a much larger number of choices.
2:3 Field Review – Fable 2

Figure 1: Fable 2 markets itself as a game about player choice

When discussing player choice, it’s difficult not to immediately think of the hit game *Fable 2* (Lionhead Studios, 2008), which has received widespread critical acclaim, selling well over 2.6 million copies and is the best-selling RPG for the Xbox 360[^1].

In *Fable 2* the player makes choices about how to complete various quests. These choices typically come down to disparate good vs. evil options, and the player’s choices primarily affect the way the player or a specific part of town looks. For example, should the player decide to help a town’s sheriff catch criminals in a certain town, the town flourishes and develops into a bustling middle-class hotspot. But should the player decide to ignore the sheriff, and instead help the criminals, the town falls into unkempt ruin. If players choose to make the town nice, they can buy posh, upper class clothes from the shops there. If players choose to make the town ugly, they can buy brigadier clothes from the shops there.

[^1]: Microsoft Corporation, 2010.
Reviewers praise *Fable 2* for the numerous choices it offers players. The magazine *Variety* said that “*no interactive world has ever felt quite so alive as Fable 2, where many paths are open, but all choices have consequences.*” Indeed, *Fable 2*’s motto is “every choice leads to a different destiny.” The reviewer at the *Official Xbox Magazine* rates the game 95% and says “*we are already eager for a second playthrough, and we’re betting a lot of you will have exactly the same reaction.*” The reviewer at *Gaming Nexus* says *Fable 2* is “*a high-water mark for player-concocted storytelling in a role-playing game.*”

The choices in *Fable 2*, however, are primarily systemic and cosmetic choices. Regardless of the choices the player makes, regardless if the player is good or evil, is a real
estate mogul, or is loved or hated by the people, the main storyline plays out in nearly identical word-for-word terms. The words that the player’s dead sister speaks to him from the grave are exactly the same, the way the final boss reacts to the player is the same, and the way the main quest plays out is exactly the same. In fact, the player’s abilities are also exactly the same.

2:4 Field Review – Bioshock

*Figure 3: Bioshock's choices largely surround those of morality*

*Bioshock* (2k Games, 2007) takes a near opposite approach to choice than *Fable 2* does – its choices primarily affect the game’s narrative. It does, however, use the illusion of choice when it comes to the game’s core experience resource, called adam.

*Bioshock’s* choices and story largely surround the concept of morality. The game tells the player they can kill corrupted children and harvest their resources for extra experience, or set them free for the possibility of a prize later. *Bioshock* is unique in our review, insomuch that it is the only game which uses choice to ask the player a moral question. Players choose between being “bad” by killing the children for extra resources or “good” for the mere possibility of a prize later on.
It turns out that players receive exactly the same amount of resources, regardless of their choice to save the children or kill the children. If the player decides to kill the children, the game’s characters call the player as an evil person, where if the player decides to save the children, the game’s characters thank the player. Depending on their choices, the game gives the player one of two endings.

The player, however, has no idea that their choices will affect the game’s ending, but feels they are truly making a decision of morality – kill the child and receive extra experience now, or save the child and possibly receive an unknown prize later. Ultimately, the player feels they are making a choice that is meaningful, and the fact that it does so purely through a combination of narrative and the illusion of choice is one of *Bioshock*’s greatest successes.
2:5 Field Review – Dragon Age

On the opposite end of the spectrum of choice is the game *Dragon Age: Origins* (Bioware, 2009). In *Dragon Age: Origins* (DAO), nearly everything the player does has a meaningful consequence and it does so along every part of the axis of influence. The player constantly makes choices regarding how to react to a situation, and should the player choose one choice over another, certain paths may close to the player for the remainder of the game.

For example, once the player has access to the game’s overworld map, they can go to any number of places. If the player goes to a nearby castle and works their way through quests there, they come across a boy who has been possessed by a demon. To rid the boy of the demon, the boy’s mother offers to sacrifice herself. The player can choose to let the mother sacrifice herself or instead the player can attempt to visit nearby wizards and gain
their help. If the player lets the mother die, one of the main party members in the game will grow to detest the player, and may eventually leave the party for good. If the player visits the wizards, or had chosen to visit the wizards prior to coming to the castle in the first place, the wizards can help and the party member will stay.

![Image](image.jpg)

Figure 5: There are typically a number of dialogue choices in DAO for any given conversation, each of which may lead to a different conclusion

DAO has likewise been a critical and commercial success. GamePro magazine wrote that DAO is “A spectacular experience from beginning to end, and with an enormous amount of choices to make, cities to visit, dungeons to crawl, NPCs to interact with, treasure to find, quests to complete and crafts to master, I feel pretty confident in saying that Dragon Age: Origins is, without a doubt, one of the most enjoyable and immersive RPG experiences I’ve had.”

The success of these three games, Fable 2 which extensively used the Illusion of Choice along the cosmetic axis, Bioshock, which used the Illusion of Choice along the
systems axis, and *Dragon Age Origins*, which made extensive use of the consequence of choice, indicates that there is a market for player choice along all player choice axes.

## 2:6 Summary

L. B. Jefferies laid out three ways in which the illusion of player choice occurs. The illusion of player choice occurs in situations where the player does not have enough data to make an informed decision, in situations where the player’s choice becomes invalid by a story or gameplay mechanic, or in situations where the outcome is effectively the same regardless of the player’s choice.

The axis influence surrounding player choice consist of four lines. The systemic line has to do with the way that players can change the game world or the way that the game plays. The spatial line has to do with players feeling like they are able to choose where they go. The narrative line has to do with players feeling like they can choose how the game progresses or concludes. The cosmetic line has to do with the players sense of agency as it relates to the way the characters or environments look.

While there are a number of well known game designers, such as David Perry and Jesse Schell, who recommend methods by which to present player choice, nowhere is there empirical research regarding the illusion of player choice and games. Additionally, nowhere do they discuss to what degree the effect of this illusion influences players.

One thing is clear from the successful performance of games focused on player choice: there is a strong market of players who wish to experience games in which player choice is a primary factor. *Fable 2* is and *Bioshock* are perfect examples of the successful utilization of the Illusion of Choice.
Chapter 3: Methodology

3:1 Introduction

In order for the player to have a substantial, changing effect on their game world, studios must invest a tremendous amount of time and resources to developing multiple branching dialogue trees, levels, characters, animations, and other game assets. This cost can be extremely prohibitive. However, there are a number of ways in which players can feel like they are having an effect on their game world without developers having to create these complex webs of game code. This thesis explores the effectiveness of the Illusion of Choice and how it effects player immersion, storyline retention, and the player’s sense of freedom.

This thesis gathered information by having SMU Guildhall students play a level in the game Fallout 3 (Bethesda Softworks, 2008). In the level players had multiple choices as to dialogue responses, gun choices, treasure choices, and choices as to which path to a location the player wishes to take, but regardless of the player’s choice the outcome is the same. Before and after playing, participants answer questions related to what games they like, how immersed they were in the game, how well they retained the story, and to what degree they felt a sense of freedom.

The test occurred at SMU Guildhall over the course of several weeks in April 2010. Initial planning stages of the test took place over the course of ten weeks between November and December 2009. The initial production of the level took place over the course of two weeks in January 2010. Throughout February and March 2010 the level was refined and feedback from other SMU Guildhall Masters students, professors, and the gaming public on the Fallout 3 forums was incorporated into the level.
Each participant’s playthrough is recorded using the FRAPS video recording software and archived. At the end of each playthrough, participants were questioned on various aspects of their narrative retention, immersion, and sense of agency. The questionnaire uses yes or no answers to answer specific questions, while more general questions leave room for participants to write their own responses.

The participants were chosen based on convenience, and were all students at SMU Guildhall. Students were asked if they are interested in participating in the survey, and are told beforehand that they will be playing a level made in the *Fallout 3* engine, but are not told what they were being asked to test. The tests took place at SMU Guildhall behind closed doors with only the participant and researcher.

The demographic data on the participants include information such as age, gender, whether or not they have played *Fallout 3* or games like it, hours playing games in general, favorite genre, and more.

### 3:2 The Product

#### 3:2:1 Quick Summary

In this single-player level, titled *The Guardians Three*, the player explores a cave system looking for a legendary lost treasure. To retrieve the treasure, the player passes through three guardians, each with a different task.

#### 3:2:2 In Depth

##### 3:2:2:1 General Game Flow

1. The player starts in a cave tunnel entrance. They move into the cave and an old hermit confronts them.
2. The hermit tells the player the legend of the three guardians guarding the treasure and that they must pass three trials. The hermit asks the player to choose one of three weapons. Regardless of the player’s weapon choice, all three weapons are the same.

3. The player kills enemies in the cave hallways and makes their way to the first guardian.

4. The player speaks with the first guardian, answers its questions, fights it, and chooses one of three doors to enter. All doors lead to the same place.

5. The player enters the second floor and makes their way to the second guardian. The second floor is much larger, and there are multiple paths and dead ends.

6. The player talks to the second guardian, answers its questions, and kills it. The player chooses one of three doors to enter. All doors lead to the same place, although each of the three doors has a different description – Easy Door, Medium Door, and Hard Door.

7. The player enters the third floor and makes their way to the third guardian. The third floor is more maze-like than the rest.

8. The player reaches the third guardian, answers its questions, and kills it. The player chooses one of three containers to open and takes their treasure. All chests contain the same treasure.

3:2:2:2 Technical Overview

3:2:2:2:1 Campaign

- Name: The Guardians Three
- Stand-alone campaign not related to the main game
3:2:2:2 Mission Location

- Setting: Underground Cave
- Time of Day: N/A
- Season: N/A
- Weather: N/A

3:2:2:3 Mission Difficulty

- Starting: 1 (of 5) – minor enemies
- Middle: 2 – slightly stronger enemies
- End: 2 – slightly stronger enemies

3:2:2:4 Mission Metrics

- Play Time: 10-15 minutes
- New Characters - 4
  - Hermit
  - Guardian 1 (Nuka Lurk)
  - Guardian 2 (Yao Guai)
  - Guardian 3 (Dog)
- Visual Themes - 1
  - Underground Caves

3:2:2:3 Details

3:2:2:3:1 Theme/Mood
The level has a dark, mysterious, and mystical feeling to it. The player is exploring for an unknown treasure, and the excitement exuded by the NPCs about the treasure only serve to pique the player’s interest.

3:2:2:3:2 Major Characters

- **Hermit** – the Hermit is an old, scraggly man who lives in the caves. The Hermit tells the player the legend of the treasure.
- **Guardian 1 (Nuka Lurk)** – The Nuka Lurk is a giant, glowing blue crustacean and gives the player their first test.
- **Guardian 2 (Yao Guai)** – The Yao Guai is a large mutated bear, and gives the player their second test.
- **Guardian 3 (Dog)** – The Dog is a normal looking Dog, and gives the player their final test.

3:2:2:3:3 Gameplay Mechanics

- **Prerequisite Skills:**
  - Character Movement
  - Basic Combat
- **Skills Learned:**
  - None

3:2:2:4 Story

3:2:2:4:1 Intro

- None

3:2:2:4:2 In-Game
• The game opens with the player at the entrance of an underground cave. The player cannot go backwards and has no explanation as to why they are there.

• The player comes across an old Hermit, who asks the player if they have come for the legendary treasure. When the player says they don’t know about any treasure, the Hermit tells the player that there is a great treasure that is said to lie deep within the bowels of the cave. He tells the player that there are three guardians guarding the treasure, and that the player must answer each of their questions correctly or face certain doom. Additionally, he tells the player that the area ahead is a vast, labyrinthine place with many doors and many directions, and one false move may lead to a quick, or slow, death.

• When the Hermit is done talking, he offers the players a choice of one of three guns. Regardless of the player’s choice, the Hermit gives the player the same gun.

• The player reaches the Nuka Lurk guardian. The Nuka Lurk guardian tells the player that strength is the strongest of all virtues, and the guardian asks the player numerous questions about how they would respond in different situations. The guardian also tells the player that, should they pass his questions, they must choose one of three doors to pass through. Ultimately, the guardian expresses his displeasure and attacks the player. The player kills the guardian and chooses one of the doors. Regardless of their choice, each of the doors leads to the same place.
• The player continues on through the second floor, which is much larger than the first and contains numerous dead ends and areas which look vast but cannot be traveled to by the player.

• The player reaches the second guardian. The second guardian tells the player that courage is the greatest of all virtues, and the guardian asks the player questions about how they would respond in different situations. The guardian is displeased and attacks the player. The player chooses one of the three doors behind the guardian and carries on to the third floor.

• The third floor is the most open of all the floors, with many passageways in each direction.

• The player reaches the third guardian. The third guardian tells the player that wisdom is the greatest of all virtues, and asks the player questions about wisdom. The guardian also tells the player that if they survive they get to choose from one of three chests. The guardian is not pleased with the player’s answers, and attacks the player. When the player kills the guardian, they choose one of the three chests, all which contain the most valuable item in the wasteland – a Portable Shower.

3:2:2:4:3 Extro

• None
3:2:2:5 Dialogue Trees

3:2:2:5:1 Dialogue Tree - Hermit

**Crusty Hermit:** What...Who’s there? I haven’t seen another living thing down here for, uh...Must’ve been years. Are you...Are you a ghost? Mother of pearl! Please...Please don’t turn me into a frog!

**Choice A:** I’m not a ghost...I don’t think I am, anyway.

**Choice B:** I am indeed a powerful phantom. Now tell me how to get out of here before I put a SPELL on you!

**Crusty Hermit:** Oh, don’t worry, my liege! Your secret is safe with me! No one else shall hear of the Phantom what passed through this day! But beware the obstacles that stand in your way, my liege! You must brave terrors that even your phantasmic kind would think twice to engage! Do you see that massive conflagration of bone and carapace behind me? It’s the skeleton of an ancient, terrible beast!

**Choice A:** I...think that’s a subway car. This is a subway station.

**Crusty Hermit:** And within lies the greatest treasure this side of the wasteland! Something old, and powerful...It’s been said that whomever obtains it shall rule the wastes ‘til the end of their days!

**Choice A:** Intriguing...And it’s just past here, you say? Perhaps I should get going.
Crusty Hermit: Wait! Before you go, you’ll need a weapon! Something what tames the beasts of this labyrinth!

Choice A: Beasts? You never mentioned any beasts!

Beasts? So now the truth comes out! If this is some trick I’ll ravage you like only a phantasm can! Post-haste!

Crusty Hermit: Gah! No, my liege! Please, this is no trick! Allow me to explain! The treasure of which I spoke, and the only way out of this place—the fates have not left it unguarded. But I can help you, my liege! I have in my possession a large cache of weaponry—with these accoutrements you’ll rout the beasts for sure!

Crusty Hermit: I can offer you a choice between three weapons—the first is the Frigid Damsel, a firearm so powerful it will rend your foes like the icy glare of a woman scorned! The second is the Fist of God, a gun that, when fired, shatters the world! And finally, we have the Fissure, an armament of such consequence that your enemies will erupt—and cease to be!
Choice A: The Frigid Damsel—
that’s the gun for me! Women 
hate me!

Choice B: Let me see the Fist 
of God—I want to experience 
the weapon that lays claim to 
that name...

Choice C: Give me the 
Fissure—it sounds like a 
fitting end for my enemies!

Crusty Hermit: As you wish! Here it is! Your 
weapon of choice! The path you seek lies straight 
ahead. But beware! As I mentioned before, there 
are opponents lying in wait! Three guardians of 
the fabled treasure, and a host of minor minions 
as well! It will take a sharp mind and steady aim 
to deal with them, but someone who smells as 
good as you smell must already have a plan to 
deal with them!

Choice A: I’ll be on my way, 
then. You’ve proven most 
useful, hermit.

Crusty Hermit: Oh, yes, yes! Thank you, my liege!

End Dialogue with 
Hermit
3:2:2:5:2 Dialogue Tree – First Guardian

**Birugenia:** You there! Who are you to disturb my slumber?

- **Choice A:** You weren't sleeping. You were just sitting there.

  **Birugenia:** Silence, fool! No one passes through here. Not until you pass my test! And the penalty for failure is I collect your oily head and eat it! What say you, human? Will you submit yourself to assessment?

  - **Choice A:** Sure, let’s hear it. I love making assholes eat their words.
  - **Choice B:** Sure, humiliating you sounds like a good use of my time.
  - **Choice C:** Actually, I think I’ll take my chances with the bum back there. I’m just going to avert my gaze and back away slowly.

  **Birugenia:** Oh, it makes noise, this one! I will enjoy ending you, human! I shall wear your skull like a grotesque headpiece and trumpet it before all of my friends as they look on in horror and disgust!

  **Birugenia:** Too late, human! Behold, it begins!
Birugenia: Behold question the first! As you must know, strength is the greatest asset of all, coveted by both man and beast. Identify for me the most effective display of strength in this situation: On a trip across the wastes, you and your friend encounter a particularly large boulder. It is an airborne boulder. Before either of you can react, the boulder crushes your friend. He tells you, “Leave me, human! Even were you to lift this boulder from o’er my shattered vessel, I would be but half a man, hardly the companion you once knew and enjoyed!” What would the strong do if confronted with this unfortunate turn of events?

**Choice A:** I would heed his wishes and let him be. He would die an honorable, manly death. I would leave feeling truly strong and just.

**Choice B:** I would remove the boulder and get my friend the medical attention he required. Physically, he would live as a shadow of his former self, but the truly strong would thrive and overcome.

**Choice C:** I would roll the boulder over completely and crush him. He would want that, being manly and strong and all.
**Birugenia**: You humans think in such...Three-dimensional terms. I am disappointed, but not surprised. Next question: In your travels across the wastes, you and your friend encounter a woman—whom the two of you immediately covet. A fire burns in your loins and you say to yourself, “Human! You look upon your future wife!” You catch a look in your friend’s eye, and you see the same thought has crossed his mind. What do you do?

**Choice A**: Woo the woman with my masculine wiles—lift many boulders for her to see until she agrees to come home with me.

**Choice B**: Drop a boulder on my friend. Take the woman as my own. We would have offspring, the first of which would serve us, then train others.

**Choice C**: Drop a boulder on the woman. Then cherish my bond with my friend—a bond of strength, as only men can know!

**Birugenia**: Pity. You’re like every other human who’s come through here. I had...mediocre aspirations for you, but you’ve failed to meet even those. Prepare yourself, human! Tonight, your blood shall fill my belly!

Ends conversation, begins combat.
3:2:2:5:3 Dialogue Tree – Second Guardian

**Bishumu:** Halt, human! If you wish to move through here, you must pass my test. But I warn you, coward! With failure comes dire consequences.

- **Choice A:** Yes, yes. I’m sure this will be a very mentally stimulating exchange. Just like the last one. Idiot.
- **Choice B:** Look, I don’t want trouble. I have money. Do you want money?
- **Choice C:** Stop. Stop it! This is ridiculous. Just let me go. The door is RIGHT THERE, and you’re a TALKING BEAR. LET ME LEAVE.
- **Choice D:** The fact that you speak doesn’t scare me, bear! Your friend, the English-speaking crab, already tried to stick it to me once today, and do you know what I did? I shot him dead. What do you think of that?

**Bishumu:** Oh, I can smell the fear on your breath, human, amongst other things. I must appear majestic and impossibly formidable to your puny mind! Now come close! The assessment awaits!
Bishumu: I have a tale for you—and then a question. There was once a man named Morlun. Yes, Morlun the Amazing, people would call him. Morlun was the greatest escape artist ever conceived by a man; he could escape anything from ropes, steel wire, coffins wrapped in chains, to a room on fire with no exits. No one could ever figure out how he did it, and he would always gloat about it to people and they would be both angry and jealous of him. With talent came confidence for Morlun, and with confidence came courage. The day arrived when Morlun could not even conceive of failure—indeed, the world’s greatest escape artist became a man literally without fear. Every morning, he awoke knowing that he had already won. And he loved showing it in people’s faces. Then, his life took a tragic turn. His most lethal enemy, Stefan Borgel, international man of traps, finally finished an inescapable gyroscopic prison. When next he awoke, Morlun found himself within this grand prison—he was a very heavy sleeper. To Borgel’s dismay, Morlun saw immediately how he could escape the prison. When Morlun told Borgel this, Borgel despaired, and wept into his hands. When next Borgel looked up, the gyroscopic prison was empty. Borgel felt a hand on his shoulder.

It was Morlun.

So I ask you this, human: Did Morlun possess courage? Or did he simply take his talents for granted? Can a person be brave and capable at the same time—or is true bravery only found when one lacks strength?

Choice A: Yes, Morlun is my hero. I want to be more like him.

Choice B: No, Morlun is a sham—a shadow of a real man.

Choice C: Of course he’s courageous! He worked very hard to get to where he got, and if he wanted to tell people how stupid he thought they were, well, too bad for them!

Choice D: Are you Morlun?

Bishumu: Are you SERIOUS, human? I put a lot of effort into telling that story and the question was NOT subjective. Are you NOTHING more than a collection of bones and a bag of flesh? There is not enough bile in my stomach to adequately express my disdain.
Bishumu: Last question, human. Try not to muck this one up. What is courage?

Choice A: Courage is adhering to one’s beliefs even though doing so invites criticism.

Choice B: Courage is the act of facing danger.

Choice C: THIS IS COURAGE! (Attack Bishumu)

Bishumu: Wrong, human! Utterly incorrect! I—I—prepare yourself!

Ends conversation, begins combat.
3:2:2:5:4 Dialogue Tree – Third Guardian

**Dog:** Human—the words come slowly to my mind, and they roll off my tongue like... Like sticky things, what adhere to my tongue. Alas, I am ancient, like an oak. Or cars. My body is failing me. Do you know how I was able to perceive your presence human? Did I glimpse you as you emerged from the previous chamber? No, my sight was robbed from me by a vengeful wife of centuries past. Did I hear you as you arrived? No, my ears were savaged by the ravages of time. Did I perceive you with my keen sense of smell? No, the time when that was possible is long past! Did I taste you with my aged, swollen tongue? No, my tongue is only for perspiring, not eating! Do you know how I perceived you then, human?

**Choice A:** You have telepathic abilities?

**Choice B:** You can read the wind?

**Choice C:** I don’t know. This is hard.

**Choice D:** You don’t actually perceive anything.

**Dog:** Such a nihilistic response, human. YOU FOOL! HAVE AT YOU!

Combat begins, but Dog immediately dies of old age. His body ragdolls, and the player is informed of his passing.
3:2:3 Visual References

Figure 6: Guardian 1 - Nuka Lurk Model

Figure 7: Guardian 2 - Yao Guai Model
Figure 8: Guardian 3 - Dog Model

Figure 9: Hermit Model Concept
Figure 10: Enemy Ghoul Model

Figure 11: Enemy Radroach Model
Figure 12: Enemy Mole Rat Model

Figure 13: Cave Reference 1
Figure 14: Cave Reference 2

Figure 15: Cave Reference 3
Figure 16: Cave Reference 4

Figure 17: Cave Reference 5
Figure 18: Cave Reference 6

Figure 19: Cave Reference 7
Figure 20: Cave Reference 8
3:2:4 Rough Maps

Figure 21: Rough Floor 1 Map (Overhead)
Figure 22: Rough Floor 1 Map (Perspective)
Figure 23: Rough Floor 2 Map (Overhead)
Figure 24: Rough Floor 2 Map (Perspective)
Figure 25: Rough Floor 3 Map (Overhead)
3:3 Data Sources

The data for this thesis comes from the participant’s questionnaire, which is both a pre-test and a post-test survey. The pre-test survey contains demographic information, while the post-test survey contains information regarding the tester’s playthrough. Digital screenshots of each participant’s playthrough were recorded for further investigation.

The post-test survey is aimed at discovering to what degree the Illusion of Choice affects a participant’s immersion, ability to retain the level’s storyline, and the player’s sense of agency. Where appropriate, each question includes a yes or no answer. Many of the questions also include room for participants to provide additional comments or clarity.
Sample pre-test questions include:

- What is your age?
- How many hours a week do you currently spend playing games?
- What is your favorite type of game to play?

Sample post-test questions include:

- Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
- Generally, do you prefer games with or without dialogue choices? Why?
- Have you played *Fallout 3* before?
- Have you played games similar to *Fallout 3*?
- What was the story of the level?
- Why did the Hermit want you to retrieve the treasure?
- What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he?
- What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he?
- What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he?
- What was the treasure?

### 3:4 Data Collection and Procedures

Students from SMU Guildhall make up the vast majority of the participants of the study. Participants specify a preferred date and time during which they are available to participate in the study. The test takes place in private rooms, and only the researcher and the participants are in the room during the testing session.

If the participant was unsure how to play the game or had any other general questions, the researcher attempted to answer them without tainting the study. When the participant asked questions, the researcher recorded the question asked and the response given.
Prior to participating in the study, the participant signs a consent form, which can be found in the Appendices. The participant also takes a pre-play demographic survey. After playing the level, the participant fills out the post-play survey.

3:5 Data Analysis

After collecting all the data from the tests, the researcher separated the data and recorded the data. The researcher then performed various statistical and graphical analyses of the data, including game type preference, those who had played *Fallout 3* or games like it previously, and average hours of games played per week, among other things. The responses to the free-answer questions were grouped into buckets representing similar responses, and were used primarily to adjust for factors such as an unclear plot point in the level’s presentation, or to see if the tester could recall basic information about the level.

The goal of the analysis is to determine to what degree the Illusion of Choice affects the participant’s feeling of immersion, sense of agency, and overall retention of the story and if the player was fooled by the Illusion of Choice or not. Another goal of the analysis is to identify external factors that may have contributed to the participant’s feeling of immersion, sense of agency, and overall retention of the story, such as Bartle personality type and game genre preference.
Chapter 4: Results and Analysis

4:1 Demographics

4:1:1 Age and Sex

![Pie chart showing gender distribution of testers]

**Figure 27:** Number and % of Testers by Gender

![Bar chart showing age distribution of testers]

**Figure 28:** Testers by Age
This thesis collected data from 22 participants, 21 of which were male and one was female. The age of testers tended toward the 25-29 year old range, with an average age of 26 years old and a median age of 25 years old. The highest age was 41 years old and the lowest age was 22 years old.

**4:1:2 Hours Spent Gaming Per Week**

All of the testers have played *Fallout 3* or a game similar to *Fallout 3* before and all of the testers identified themselves as a “gamer”. The average hours spend gaming per week (pre-Guildhall) was 15 and the median hours spent gaming per week was 12. One tester failed to respond to the question.
4:1:3 Tester Favorite Genres

Each of the testers chose a selection of their favorite game genres. The most popular genres were First Person Shooter, Action, and Role Playing Game with 18, 17, and 16 respondents, respectively. The least favorite genres were Rhythm, Sports, and Simulation, with 1, 2, and 2 respondents, respectively. Half the group played puzzle and platformer games.
4:1:4 Tester Bartle Personality Types

The Modified Bartle Test is a series of psychological questions which attempts to bucket players into one of three categories – Achiever, Explorer, and Killer. Richard Bartle defined his Bartle Player Types in his work “Hearts, Clubs, Diamonds, Spades: Players Who Suit MUDs.” The Modified Bartle Test is differentiated from a standard Bartle Test only in that it asks fewer questions and doesn’t take into account the Socializer player type.

Achiever Bartle types are interested in mastering one or more aspects of the game. Achievers are proud of their status as top-tier players of the game. Explorer Bartle types are interested in discovering the game world and experiencing all the surprises it has to offer. Explorers are proud to be knowledgeable about the games they play. Killer Bartle types are interested in demonstrating their superiority over other players or characters in the game world. They are proud of their fighting skills.
Of the three Bartle personality types, Achiever, Explorer, and Killer, the overwhelming majority of testers were Explorers, followed by Killers and Achievers. Explorers made up more than 50% of the testers, with 12 respondents. Killers made up for roughly 30% of the testers, with 7 respondents. Achievers made up less than 15% of testers, with 3 respondents.

4:1:5 Tester Reasons for Choosing Paths in Games

Testers were asked about the way they choose which path they travel in games. Fifteen testers said they chose paths because they were interested in exploring, while eleven testers said they were looking for combat. Only six testers said they chose a specific path due to the thought that the designer wanted them to go that way.
4:2 Post Play Survey Results

4:2:1 General Tester Experience

After each play session, testers filled out a post-test survey consisting of 18 short answer questions and one multiple choice question. The questions asked everything from the player’s enjoyment of the level to how well they could recall the storyline, to if they thought they could choose the outcome of the level or not. The survey and results for all testers can be found in the Appendices.

Overall, 13 of the 22 testers responded that they were interested in the story outcome, while only 7 of the testers responded that they were immersed in the story. 15 testers responded that they prefer to have dialogue choices in games, 16 testers prefer path choices in games, and 15 testers prefer to control the story in games.

18 testers felt like they had numerous path and dialogue choices in the games, though only 8 testers felt that they had an impact on the way the level played out. The most common
reason for this, as indicated by short answers and verbal follow up, is that by the time testers encountered their third guardian and failed to answer the third guardian’s questions correctly, they therefore assumed that there was nothing they could to do prevent the guardian from attacking them. In other words, because they were seemingly unable to elicit a different response from any of the three guardians, they felt that each guardian was going to attack them regardless of their answers. However, 12 testers said they felt the guardians response to their answers was appropriate given their answer, so we can infer that some of the testers who felt that they had no impact on the overall story of the game did indeed feel that they had some impact on the way the dialogue played out.

4:2:2 Tester Experience by Player Type

Those players who were interested in the story’s outcome were disproportionately of the Explorer type. Those players who were the Killer type disproportionately felt their dialogue choices had some impact on the way the story played out and felt the guardians
responded to their answers appropriately. Those participants who were of the Achiever type had mixed results.

4:2:3 Tester Experience - Achievers

![The Experience of Achievers](image)

Figure 35: The Experience of Achievers

Achievers were the group that were least interested in the story. They are also the smallest group, with only 3 testers representing Achievers. While the majority of Achievers preferred choices in games, none of them felt like they had any impact on the way the game would play out.
4:2:4 Tester Experience - Explorers

![The Experience of Explorers](image)

Figure 36: The Experience of Explorers

75% of the study’s Explorers were interested in the story outcome. 75% of the study’s Explorers also prefer dialogue choices in games, prefer path choices in games, prefer story control, and felt like that had numerous choices in the level. 33% of the study’s Explorers were immersed in the level and only 33% felt they had an impact on the way the story would play out.
4:2:5 Tester Experience - Killers

![The Experience of Killers](image)

Figure 37: The Experience of Killers

Killers represent 7 – about 30% - of the study’s testers. Killers were generally not immersed or interested in story, and they weren’t necessarily sold on having the ability to control the story. All of the Killers, however, felt like they were faced with multiple choices in the game, and more than half of them felt like their choices had impact on the game.
4:3 Correlations

Correlations are a statistical measure of how two variables interact with one another. Correlation numbers range from 0 (changing the value of one variable has no effect on the other) to 1 (changing the value of one variable has a very strong effect on the other). Note that because our sample size is so small, there is likely a very large margin of error in our statistical analysis.

4:3:1 Correlations of Interest in Story Outcome

Overall, there was a high correlation between players being interested in the story’s outcome and the player’s immersion, preference for dialogue choices, and the feeling that they had an impact on the story. In other words, players who felt the story was compelling early on were more likely to believe they had an impact on the game. Those players were also more immersed in the game. Interestingly, there was no correlation between players
being interested in the outcome of the story and the feeling that they had multiple dialogue and path choices.

4:3:2 Correlations of Immersion

![Correlation Between Being Immersed in the Game and...]

Unlike the correlation between being interested in the story outcome and the feeling that there were multiple choices, there is some correlation between being immersed in the game and the player feeling like they had choices. In other words, the players who were willing to become immersed in the game were willing to weigh the consequences of their actions.
Players who prefer dialogue choices in games were strongly correlated to preferring story control and path choices in games. They were also interested in the story’s outcome. These dialogue-preferring players felt the guardians did not respond appropriately to their answers.
4:3:4 Correlations of Preferring Path Choices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Correlation</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interested in Story’s Outcome</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immersed in Game</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefers Dialogue Choice in Games</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefers Story Control</td>
<td>(0.07)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felt Like Had Choices</td>
<td>(0.09)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felt Like Had Impact</td>
<td>(0.23)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felt Like Had Appropriate Guard Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 41: Correlation - Path Choice Preference

Those testers who prefer path choices in games also tended to prefer dialogue choices in games and preferred story control. Generally, there was no correlation to a player preferring path choices in games and any of our other factors.
4:3:5 Correlations of the Feeling of Many Choices

There is a strong correlation between testers feeling that they had choices in the level and the feeling that the guardians responded to their answers appropriately. There is also correlation between the feeling that they had choices and being immersed, preferring story control, and feeling that they had an impact.
4:3:6 Correlations of Testers Feeling They Had an Impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlation Between the Feeling They Had an Impact and...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interested in Story's Outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 43: Correlation - Feeling They Had an Impact

There is a strong correlation between players feeling they had an impact on the level and being interested in the story’s outcome. Additionally, there is a strong correlation between players feeling they had an impact on the level and the feeling that guardians responded appropriately to their answers. There are also correlations between this and players being immersed in the game and the feeling that there were multiple choices throughout.
4:3:7 Correlations of Guardian Appropriate Response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlation Between Believing the Guardians Responded Appropriately and...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interested in Story's Outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 44: Correlation - Believing Guardians Responded Appropriately

There was a strong correlation between testers believing the guardians responded appropriately and the testers feeling that they had an impact on the level. Additionally, there was a strong correlation between testers believing guardians responded appropriately and the feeling that they had numerous choices in the level.
4:4 Data on Choices

4:4:1 All Tester Information

Figure 45: Choices - All Testers

Figure 46: Tester Recall of Story Post Play
Figure 47: Player Gun Choices

Figure 48: Player Treasure Choices
In terms of the choices testers made, testers were overwhelmingly most likely to choose the third gun – the Fissure. Players were about even on which treasure they picked, although tended to go toward the safe. As far as tester recall of the story, testers were most likely to recall the story of the first guardian and last guardian, but half the testers couldn’t convey the story of the second guardian. Finally, most testers didn’t remember which of the
three doors they entered, but those who did generally picked the easy door. Of the testers who noticed that they could pick a door’s difficulty, three testers believed changed the difficulty of the level through their door choice.

### 4:4:2 Achiever Choice Data

Of the Achievers, gun choices were evenly split between the three guns. Two of the three Achievers chose the treasure chest, while the other Achiever chose the treasure safe. Two of the three Achievers didn’t notice which door they picked when they picked one. Only one achiever was able to recall any of the guardian stories.

![Achiever Choices](image.png)
4:4:3 Explorer Choice Data

![Exploration Choices](image)

Figure 52: Explorer Choices

Explorers were overwhelmingly likely to pick the Fissure gun. Short answer responses as to why this was so indicated they liked the dialogue the best. Treasure picks were more or less even among Explorers – the short answers as to why provided no discernable trend. Explorers were also by far the best at recalling the guardian’s stories, with nearly all of the Explorer testers able to recall fine details of the stories. Finally, one third of the Explorers didn’t notice the doors they picked were different. Of those who did, most picked the easy door.
4:4:4 Killer Choice Data

![Killer Choices Chart]

Figure 53: Killer Choices

Killers avoided the Fist gun altogether – about 60% of them picked the Damsel, while about 40% of them picked the Fissure. Killers preferred the safe. Less than half the Killers recalled any guardian’s story, and only one could remember the second guardian’s story. Slightly less than half the killers didn’t notice the door choice, but of those that did most of them picked the easy door.

4:5 Data Analysis Conclusions & Interpretation

Prior to testing, the projected outcome of this thesis was that the illusion of choice would be successful in giving players the non-linear experience they desire. After testing, the data suggests that this is true in some circumstances, but is not true other circumstances. This leaves plenty of room for further study on the subject.

4:5:1 Where the Illusion of Choice Failed

The data suggests that players are most easily able to recognize the Illusion of Choice in circumstances where there is a detectable pattern of Illusion. For example, the written
feedback suggests that during the earlier floors testers felt that they had the ability to change the outcome of the level, but after each of the three guardians were unappeased by the testers’ answers and proceeded to attack the player, many testers came to believe that the game was rigged, so to speak, and that none of their choices would end up mattering. In other words, by the third floor the testers were learning the illusion’s pattern.

Another form of pattern recognition is that which the game does itself in the form of an auto-generated map. The game tracks where the player has progressed, and makes a map of their progression. Since every one of our testers had played the game prior to the test, players were aware that this was an option. Those players who closely tracked their map progress tended to be the players who were less likely to be fooled by the level’s twisting passageways.

4:5:2 Where the Illusion of Choice Succeeded

The Illusion of Choice succeeded in circumstances where there were clear and descriptive choices. The guardians, for example, let the players know what sort of answer they were looking for (Strength, Courage, or Wisdom). Players generally believed the guardians were directly responding to their choices, although by the third guardian many players figured it out.

In the instance of the treasure, however, where the players could see all three chests in front of them, players felt they had a choice. There were a number of reasons players picked a certain chest – they thought the designer wanted them to, they thought the designer didn’t want them to, it was closest, it was the smallest, *Fallout 3* always had the best loot in the safe, etc. This fact, combined with the fact that many of the testers didn’t notice the 2nd
floor door descriptions (each of the doors look exactly the same), hints that players are more receptive to choices that are clear and tactile.

Another example of its successful use is that of the guns. Due to the descriptions of the guns, the testers felt that they were making an important decision so had to choose carefully. An overwhelming majority of the testers chose the gun with the most destructive description, and most responded that they felt they made the right decision.

Finally, when choosing which treasure to open, players frequently deliberated. Most of them went with what they believed to be the safest of the three boxes – the safe, but the distribution between each of the boxes was nearly even. Players felt they were making a decision when picking from these three visibly distinct containers.

4:5:3 Data Analysis Conclusion

The data suggests that there is a large differentiation between the three player types and how susceptible they are to the Illusion of Choice. None of the study’s Achievers felt that they had the ability to impact the story, while more than half of the study’s Killers felt that they did have the ability to impact the story. Explorers, who strongly prefer choice in games and arguably have the most experience playing them, were also unconvinced they had any impact, but less so than the Achievers. Additionally, there appears to be correlation between players willing to be “immersed” in the game and how susceptible they were to the Illusion of Choice. This implies that a player’s enjoyment of the game may have an effect on their willingness to be fooled.

The data suggests that the Illusion of Choice fails to work when players are able to discern the pattern of the illusion, such as having all three guardians eventually attack the player or such as being able to view the map at anytime. Although no players saved and
reloaded their game, a number of players commented that they typically do that in games to see what the best outcome would have been. In this case, the Illusion of Choice would also have failed.

The data suggests that the Illusion of Choice works best when its deception technique is not used frequently or in an identifiable pattern. Additionally, it works best when there are unique descriptors, be them textual, as in the case of the guns, or physical, as in the case of the treasure boxes. Also, the data suggests that players may be more likely to be susceptible to the Illusion of Choice when the choice they are making benefits them, as in the case of the guns or the treasure. Regardless of their choice, they are rewarded and less likely to question their actions or reload and try again to get the “right” answer.
Chapter 5: Conclusion

Giving players freedom in video games comes at a cost – every new player choice requires additional art assets, voice recordings, or other forms of expensive manpower. This project first looks at ways in which designers can use the Illusion of Choice to give players a meaningful experience. Then it explores how effective these methods are at giving players the sense of agency they crave. Twenty two testers played a level in the Fallout 3 (G.E.C.K.) game engine created specifically to test the Illusion of Choice. The hypothesis for the project was that players could indeed be fooled by the Illusion of Choice.

The purpose of this study is to determine to what degree the Illusion of Choice to give the player a richer experience, where the Illusion of Choice is best used, and in what cases it should be avoided. Its secondary purpose is to understand how the Illusion of Choice affects the player’s sense of immersion, the player’s sense of agency, and the player’s ability to remember the story of the overall narrative. Participants of the study played a level containing multiple uses of the Illusion of Choice and filled out a questionnaire regarding their experience. Throughout the level, players encountered numerous dialogue and path choices. Ultimately, regardless of any of the choices players made, the outcome for each player was the same. All the dialogue responses were the same, all the treasure choices gave the same rewards, and all the paths lead to the same place. Regardless of the player’s actions, none of the choices have any meaningful consequences on either story or gameplay.

This thesis examines three different types of false choice. The first occurs when the player is unable to make an informed decision due to a lack of information. The second type of false choice occurs when the player makes a choice, but the consequences become
invalidated by the storyline or gameplay. The third type of false choice occurs when the player chooses between two things that provide the same outcome, but are presented differently. Additionally, the study breaks choice down to four axis of influence specifically for games: systemic choice, where the player feels that they are changing what they do in the game world; spatial choice, where the player feels they choose where they want to go; narrative choice where the player feels they have an effect upon the game’s narrative; and cosmetic choices, where the player chooses something only having to do with the way their avatar looks.

This thesis also examines illusionary choice from a game designer’s point of view. David Perry, in his book *David Perry on Game Design: A Brainstorming ToolBox* (Perry, 2009), argues that players want options, but it does not necessarily make the player feel freer. Additionally, he argues that choices should enhance the gameplay, but that it ultimately comes down to the player’s perception of the choice. Jesse Schell, in his book *The Art of Game Design: A Book of Lenses* (Schell, 2007), states that designers should give players choices that have an impact on how the game turns out, and that meaningless choice is a “trap” for designers. Neither designer backs up their claims with data. This thesis also looks at recent successful games that use player choice, and ways in which they utilize it successfully.

This thesis tests the Illusion of Choice by giving participants a level built in Fallout 3 specifically for this study. The level contains numerous path and dialogue choices and tests a number of factors regarding the Illusion of Choice. Regardless of any actions the player takes, the result is effectively the same. Through the study’s own development efforts,
adding in some illusionary choice certainly required more man hours than a purely liner level would have, but was significantly less than creating a level with meaningful choice.

The study collects data through a pre-play survey, through a post-play survey, and by recording the playthrough of each tester. Based on these results, the study helps determine where the Illusion of Choice can be better utilized or should be avoided.

Because this study focuses on a single game engine, a single level, and is performed on a very limited sample set, further research needs to be done to build a case for or against using the Illusion of Choice in games. Future research can perform a similar test in a different engine or can explore additional ways to use the Illusion of Choice beyond just path choice or dialogue choice. Future research can also focus on proving players meaningful choice vs. the Illusion of Choice, and test whether or not a player’s experience in enhanced to a large enough degree to justify the additional complexity. Future research could look into the axis of influence, and how choices in its pillars affect the Illusion of Choice. Future research could look into creating a similar level while testing additional factors, such as whether or not enemy difficulty felt different despite having the exact same stats. Future research could look into whether or not meaningful choice does have a greater impact upon player experience versus non-meaningful choice. Finally, research can also include how often the player can be given a particular type of illusion before it no longer fools them.

Ultimately, the goal of this thesis is to determine whether or not the Illusion of Choice enhances player experiences and in what situations it is successful at doing so. If it can enhance a player’s experience, developers can use this knowledge to give players a richer, fuller game without the prohibitive cost of non-linear gameplay. The data indicates that the
Illusion of Choice is a factor in how players play their games, and to what extent they enjoy them, and further research needs to be done to help identify the best uses of this valuable game design concept.
References

Books


Articles


Games

2K Games. (2007). *Bioshock*; Multiplatform. 2K Games


Appendix A – Survey Results

Tester 1
Pre-Play Survey

Age: 25

Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 14

What are your favorite game genres? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X Action</th>
<th>X Adventure</th>
<th>X Strategy</th>
<th>X Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X FPS</td>
<td>X RPG</td>
<td>X Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1. Explore a new area
   3. Defeat an enemy
   2. Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   3. The highest score
   2. The most kills
   1. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Recon the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Capture objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kill enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Would you rather play as a:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Sniper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Scout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. For you, which is most exciting?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Discovering a secret treasure vault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Finishing a difficult quest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Defeating a powerful boss</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Two levels worth of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A powerful new weapon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Access to a new area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Would you rather be:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Smart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wealthy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Read the manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Go play online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Check out the game’s achievements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Many different areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Many different quests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Many different enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. Would you rather:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Know a secret no one else does</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2 Have an item no one else has
3 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   Progressing forward

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   No because I didn’t know what I was working toward

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   No because everything felt the same, repeated. Nothing in the level was compelling

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   No, because they are often too analogue. Each choice is the “mad and bad” choice or the “good and kind” choice – no grey area. You are either an evil jerk or a kind weenie.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Yes, usually each path presents a different experience. I feel more like the game is changing to fit me.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   No, because usually the story is so binary with a good ending or a bad ending

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes. Morrowind, Oblivion, Kotor
8. What was the story of the level?
   Three guardians protecting a great treasure

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The first one. I chose it because it said it froze people and that sounded fun. The other two just destroyed people.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The left most one, because it was halfway between a big safe and a small box. I got a “portable shower”

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He was a big mirelurk. He asked me about strength and relationships. Both romantic and friendship.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    A big dog monster. He spoke about courage and an escape artist.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    A big wolf. He asked how he perceived my coming.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
    I picked the right one randomly.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
I noticed the second area was harder, but I wasn’t sure if it was because of something I did.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   No, it felt like the guardians would hate me no matter what

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Yes and no, I got the impression they meant to fight despite my answer.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (put an X next to all that apply)
   X Exploration
   Speed
   Combat
   Randomly
   Believed designer wanted me to go that way

   Other:

**Tester 2**

Pre-Play Survey

Age: 22

Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 40
What are your favorite game genres? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>X Action</th>
<th>X Adventure</th>
<th>X Strategy</th>
<th>X Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X FPS</td>
<td>X RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1. Explore a new area
   2. Defeat an enemy
   3. Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   2. The highest score
   1. The most kills
   3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   3. Recon the area
   2. Capture objectives
   1. Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   3. Sniper
   1. Soldier
   2. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   3. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   1. Finishing a difficult quest
   2. Defeating a powerful boss
6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   3 Two levels worth of experience
   1 A powerful new weapon
   2 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   1 Strong
   3 Smart
   2 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   3 Read the manual
   1 Go play online
   2 Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   3 Many different areas
   1 Many different quests
   2 Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
    3 Know a secret no one else does
    1 Have an item no one else has
    2 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level? Finding out what the treasure is

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not? I was interested in the outcome of the story because the strangeness of the characters made me curious and wonder what this was all about.
3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Yes, I was immersed in the story. The maze like hallways and strange character with riddles made it feel like you were on a quest for treasure.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   I prefer games with multiple dialogue choices because they provide an element of realism and make me feel like what I do has some impact on the game world.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   I prefer games with multiple path choices because I like exploring and finding loot.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Yes because it adds an element of realism and immersion.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes, yes. Oblivion, Kotor, Dragon Age, Mass Effect, others.

8. What was the story of the level?
   Finding a treasure by making your way past 3 guardians that each try to teach a different lesson

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The machine gun because I liked the name of it. Yes, I made a good decision because I like to shoot fast.
10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
   The safe because usually safes in fallout contain the best loot. I received the portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A series of questions relating to friendship. He was a mirelurk and talked about destroying or keeping your friendship with someone.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He asked what strength means. He was a bear.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   Asked me about bravery. He was a dog and talked about the different interpretations of courage.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   I picked the left one because I usually pick the left door

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   No

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
Yes because in answering incorrectly I had to kill each guardian which resulted in a tougher situation

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain. Yes they did, given their characters.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exploration</th>
<th>Speed</th>
<th>Combat</th>
<th>Randomly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other:

**Tester 3**

Pre-Play Survey

Age: 25

Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? N/A

What are your favorite game genres? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X Action</th>
<th>X Adventure</th>
<th>X Strategy</th>
<th>X Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>X RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Would you rather:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Explore a new area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Defeat an enemy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Accomplish an important objective</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The highest score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The most kills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A good strategy for the next match</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Recon the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Capture objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Kill enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Would you rather play as a:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Sniper</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Soldier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Scout</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5. For you, which is most exciting?</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Discovering a secret treasure vault</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Finishing a difficult quest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Defeating a powerful boss</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Two levels worth of experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. A powerful new weapon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Access to a new area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7. Would you rather be:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Strong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Smart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

3 Read the manual
1 Go play online
2 Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

1 Many different areas
2 Many different quests
3 Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

1 Know a secret no one else does
2 Have an item no one else has
3 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   To obtain the treasure

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Yes I wanted to find out the origin of the treasure

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Not terribly. Each creature seemed unrelated to each other and the cave.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With. I like my character to have a personality I can mold.
5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Without. I hate the feeling that I missed out on content.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   No, I want to feel like I reached the one “true” ending when I finish and multiple branches that converge at the same ending tend to reveal the meta-design of the game rather than immerse.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes. Fallout 3. Also system shock and dues ex.

8. What was the story of the level?
   A deranged hermit sends the player after a treasure. Along the way, creatures guarding the path challenge the player to answer questions of a philosophical nature.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The Fissure breech. The gun seemed like a good choice since it had fairly good stands and I prefer assault rifles.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The safe because it seems that had a more secure container and would hold a better treasure. A portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
What I would do if 1) my friend is crushed by a boulder and 2) my friend and I coveted the same woman. He spoke of courage and was a crab named Birugenia.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He asked me if Morlun the escape artist was truly brave. He was a bear named Bishumu. He spoke of the true nature of courage.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   The 3rd guardian asked how he perceived me when he lost his senses. He was an old dog. He spoke little, only asking how he sensed me before attacking!

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   I don’t recall. I chose randomly.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   I did not.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   The caves were winding and mazelike, but converged at the same points. Conversations often ignored my words so no, it felt linear.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   No, it felt like I would always encounter the guardians in the same order and I would always have to fight them.
18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.

No, the guardians responded as if they were talking AT me rather than to me, ignoring the specifics of my chosen words.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (put an X next to all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other: Lighting

Tester 4
Pre-Play Survey

Age: 24
Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 10-20

What are your favorite game genres? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X Action</th>
<th>X Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>X Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)
1. Would you rather:
   1. Accomplish an important objective
   2. Explore a new area
   3. Defeat an enemy

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1. The highest score
   2. A good strategy for the next match
   3. The most kills

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   1. Capture objectives
   2. Kill enemies
   3. Recon the area

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1. Sniper
   2. Soldier
   3. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1. Defeating a powerful boss
   2. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   3. Finishing a difficult quest

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   1. Two levels worth of experience
   2. A powerful new weapon
   3. Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   1. Smart
   2. Strong
   3. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   1. Read the manual
   2. Play immediately
1. Go play online
2. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   3. Many different areas
   1. Many different quests
   2. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
   3. Know a secret no one else does
   2. Have an item no one else has
   1. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   Exploring every area of the map to make sure I didn’t miss anything

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Not really. I was in a hurry so I just wanted to finish.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   No, but part of the issue was my contacts were burning my eyes, which make long text unenjoyable.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With choices because I always like to have an opinion.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   With because you have more area to explore
6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Yes, I like when my actions have consequence

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes, Yes. Oblivion.

8. What was the story of the level?
   An old man though you were a ghost and had to kill 3 guardians to get a treasure

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The Fissure breech. Because it sounded like it would be the most effective

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The one on the far left because I thought the beggar would want it.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    If I would help a man crushed by a boulder. He was a mirelurk. The story of the man being crushed.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    How you would win a woman’s heart. A bear. I don’t know. My eyes were really starting to burn.
13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   How he sensed my presence despite being so old. A wolf. No idea, my eyes were on fire.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The hard door because I thought it would be more challenging.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Nope

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes, I always seemed to have 3 choices

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   Not really. It seemed like there was only one result for each of the choices.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   They seemed generic, but appropriate.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (put an X next to all that apply)
   X Exploration
   Speed
   X Combat
   Randomly
   X Believed designer wanted me to go that way
Other:

**Tester 5**

Pre-Play Survey

Age: 23

Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 30+

What are your favorite game genres? (put an X next to all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>X RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   2 Defeat an enemy
   3 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   2 The highest score
   3 The most kills
   1 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   2 Recon the area
   3 Capture objectives
1. Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1. Sniper
   3. Soldier
   2. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   2. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   3. Finishing a difficult quest
   1. Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   3. Two levels worth of experience
   2. A powerful new weapon
   1. Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   3. Strong
   1. Smart
   2. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   3. Read the manual
   1. Go play online
   2. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   2. Many different areas
   3. Many different quests
   1. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
    1. Know a secret no one else does
    3. Have an item no one else has
2 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey
1. What was your motivation for completing the level? The Treasure

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not? The story bored me, too redundant

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not? Nope, it felt fake

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why? With – makes me feel as if I can change the outcome of the story

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why? With, because maybe I got lucky and pick the one with bomb stuff

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why? Yes so I can play god in their universe.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones? Yes. No.

8. What was the story of the level? Find old man, tells of treasure, go get it, get interrupted, finally find it
9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   Third one. Text seemed better

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    Smallest, the shower. The most power comes in the most inconspicuous containers.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He annoyed me

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    Something about courage

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He died instantly

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
    Don’t even remember

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
    It was not difficult to begin with started running past everything

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
    Seemed random route – choice meant nothing
17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you? I didn’t notice

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain. Canned response

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (put an X next to all that apply)

   X Exploration
   X Speed
   X Combat
   X Randomly
   Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other:

**Tester 6**
Pre Play Survey
Age: 26
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 8
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✔️ FPS</td>
<td>✔️ RPG</td>
<td>✔️ Simulation</td>
<td>✔️ Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>✔️ Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Would you rather:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Explore a new area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Defeat an enemy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Accomplish an important objective</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have: |   |   |
|   | 3 The highest score |   |
|   | 1 The most kills |   |
|   | 2 A good strategy for the next match |   |

| 3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to: |   |   |
|   | 1 Recon the area |   |
|   | 2 Capture objectives |   |
|   | 3 Kill enemies |   |

| 4. Would you rather play as a: |   |   |
|   | 3 Sniper |   |
|   | 2 Soldier |   |
|   | 1 Scout |   |

| 5. For you, which is most exciting? |   |   |
|   | 1 Discovering a secret treasure vault |   |
|   | 2 Finishing a difficult quest |   |
|   | 3 Defeating a powerful boss |   |

| 6. As a quest reward, would you prefer: |   |   |
|   | 2 Two levels worth of experience |   |
|   | 3 A powerful new weapon |   |
|   | 1 Access to a new area |   |

| 7. Would you rather be: |   |   |
|   | 3 Strong |   |
8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Read the manual</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Go play online</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Check out the game’s achievements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Many different areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Many different quests</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Many different enemies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. Would you rather:

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Know a secret no one else does</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Have an item no one else has</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Defeat an enemy no one else can</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   Seeing what came next

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   At first, yes. By the end, no. I felt frustrated when none of my answers were right. Like nothing I could say would let me avoid fighting the guardians

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Yes. It was oddly humorous.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
With choices... but only if they are meaningful.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Yes, again, only if each is fun and interesting in its own way.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Yes. I feel like I am part of the character then.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   No, and yes. I have played Oblivion and Mass Effect

8. What was the story of the level?
   To defeat the 3 guardians by either destroying them or answering their riddles.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   Fist of God. It sounded the most powerful

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    Safe. It looked like it would contain the greatest prize

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    About strength and what defined it. Don’t remember his name. He spoke of boulders and crushing friends. A giant crab/ beetle/ scorpion thing.
12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   About courage and its definition. Don’t remember name. Spoke about whether courage was someone being strong when they are not, etc. A bear

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A wolf. He asked about sensing. Don’t remember his name. Don’t remember. He attacked after just 1 question.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The middle one. The torch was closer, I think...

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   No.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   No. I couldn’t get and answer that pleased any of the guardians

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   No. They felt wrong.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)
Exploration
Speed
Combat
Randomly
Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Tester 7
Pre Play Survey
Age: 30
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 25
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   2 Defeat an enemy
3. Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   - The highest score
   - The most kills
   - A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   - Recon the area
   - Capture objectives
   - Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   - Sniper
   - Soldier
   - Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   - Discovering a secret treasure vault
   - Finishing a difficult quest
   - Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   - Two levels worth of experience
   - A powerful new weapon
   - Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   - Strong
   - Smart
   - Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   - Read the manual
   - Go play online
   - Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-
Playing Game (MMO):

1. Many different areas
2. Many different quests
3. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

1. Know a secret no one else does
2. Have an item no one else has
3. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   Discovering what was at the end.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Somewhat – the story was clearly designed to be humorous, so I only took it at face value.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   No – my sense of immersion, and the pull forward, was independent of the story.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With – a chance to express yourself and control the outcome – so long as the changes based on your choices are relevant/related to choices.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   With – a chance to craft the personal experience
6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Yes – same as above.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes, and yes – Morrowind

8. What was the story of the level?
   A bum told me about treasure and three mythical guardians (a dungeon crawler)

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   Fist of Gold – cool description and name – yes – powerful weapon, large clip, defensive spread

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    Middle – most unassuming/ least devious choice – shower!

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    Asked about the definition of strength – a big mirelurk who asked about a friend getting crushed by a boulder, and then impressing a woman.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    A big yao guai, asked about courage using the escape artist analogy/story – asked what courage was

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
A big, blind, deaf, smell-less dog, asked about... don’t remember.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   Right, because I went left first on the first floor

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   No

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   I felt like I had an impact on whether or not the guardians would attack me, but the level progression felt like it would be the same, regardless (3 floors, treasure at the end)

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Yes – I felt that I was trying to understand their ideologies, so if they answered strangely, it was because I didn’t understand them.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

   - Exploration
   - Speed
   - Combat
   - Randomly
   - Believed designer wanted me to go that way
Tester 8
Pre Play Survey
Age: 25
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 3-5
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   2 Explore a new area
   1 Defeat an enemy
   3 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   3 The highest score
   1 The most kills
   2 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|   | 2 Recon the area  
|   | 3 Capture objectives  
|   | 1 Kill enemies  
| 4. | Would you rather play as a:  
|   | 2 Sniper  
|   | 1 Soldier  
|   | 3 Scout  
| 5. | For you, which is most exciting?  
|   | 3 Discovering a secret treasure vault  
|   | 2 Finishing a difficult quest  
|   | 1 Defeating a powerful boss  
| 6. | As a quest reward, would you prefer:  
|   | 3 Two levels worth of experience  
|   | 1 A powerful new weapon  
|   | 2 Access to a new area  
| 7. | Would you rather be:  
|   | 1 Strong  
|   | 3 Smart  
|   | 2 Wealthy  
| 8. | If you just bought a game, would you first:  
|   | 2 Read the manual  
|   | 1 Go play online  
|   | 3 Check out the game’s achievements  
| 9. | What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):  
|   | 2 Many different areas  
|   | 3 Many different quests  
|   | 1 Many different enemies  
| 10. | Would you rather:  
|   | 3 Know a secret no one else does  

David Gerald Saunders  
August 9th, 2010
1. Have an item no one else has
2. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   Running thru and killing many monsters

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   No, it was a bit too wordy for my tastes

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   No, I kinda lost track of what was going on in the midst of the carnage

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   Without I’d rather have a story just told to me then have to make choices

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Yes as long as the multiple paths provide distinct experiences

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   No the story isn’t as rich with so many branches

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes, just fallout 3

8. What was the story of the level?
   Some crazy guy wanted me to kill 3 monsters
9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
The first one, I didn’t get the idea that there were differences between the three, gun, gun, gun

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
The left one I saw before that a left choice was the hard one so I thought the left treasure would be the greatest

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
I forgot, I just wanted to kill him

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
Same as above

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
Same as above I just got the impression that I wasn’t going to get anything good from them.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
The left door I think it said hard and I wanted to face harder enemies

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
No
16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer? Yes perhaps too many

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you? Yes I could listen to the animals or just kill them

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain. Sorry, I just got tired of their lengthy talk so I just tried to get out.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

☐ Exploration
☐ Speed
☒ Combat
☐ Randomly
☐ Believed designer wanted me to go that way
☒ Other: Find powerful items

Tester 9
Pre Play Survey
Age: 24
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 15
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)
Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   2 Defeat an enemy
   3 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   2 The highest score
   1 The most kills
   3 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   3 Recon the area
   2 Capture objectives
   1 Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   2 Sniper
   1 Soldier
   3 Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   3 Discovering a secret treasure vault
   2 Finishing a difficult quest
   1 Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
3 Two levels worth of experience  
1 A powerful new weapon  
2 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:  
1 Strong  
2 Smart  
3 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:  
1 Read the manual  
2 Check out the game’s achievements  
3 Go play online

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):  
1 Many different areas  
2 Many different quests  
3 Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:  
1 Have an item no one else has  
2 Defeat an enemy no one else can  
3 Know a secret no one else does

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?  
To see what I would encounter next.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?  
Yes mainly to see what hilarious character I would come across.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?  
No mainly because the humorous characters detracted from the story.
4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   Generally without because I always feel the choices are superficial in the end.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Without multiple path choices because, again, in the end it always feels like the choices are too superficial.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   No because it generally feels like the story isn’t as focused as a strictly linear story.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes I have played Fallout 3 before and games similar to it such as Mass Effect 2 and Dragon Age.

8. What was the story of the level?
   To get past all of the guardians.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The Fist of God. The description sounded interesting. Yes I did.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The left treasure chest.
11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A giant mirelurk who asked about strength.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A small dog who asked about friendship.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A Yaoguai who asked about wisdom.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The right door.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Yes, it took twice as many hits to destroy enemies.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   Yes since if you answered all of the story questions correctly, you wouldn’t have to fight.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Yes.
19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other:

Tester 10
Pre Play Survey
Age: 32
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 4
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
3. In a new area
1. Defeat an enemy
2. Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:

2. The highest score
1. The most kills
3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:

3. Recon the area
2. Capture objectives
1. Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:

3. Sniper
1. Soldier
2. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?

3. Discovering a secret treasure vault
2. Finishing a difficult quest
1. Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:

2. Two levels worth of experience
1. A powerful new weapon
3. Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:

1. Strong
2. Smart
3. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

3. Read the manual
1. Go play online
2. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

- 2 Many different areas
- 3 Many different quests
- 1 Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

- 3 Know a secret no one else does
- 2 Have an item no one else has
- 1 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   I hate leaving things unfinished.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Well, getting a cool item is nice. But I’m not interested in story that much.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Not really. It has some good set up, but I don’t relate to the character, so getting immersed into the story is hard.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With. I like choices.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
With. I like multiple paths. The more the better. It helps to have a reason to go back.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Hm... sometimes. Unless the story is tight, then I sometimes get lost on what I’m supposed to do.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes. Oblivion, Fable

8. What was the story of the level?
   To complete three challenges and win a treasure.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   Fist of God. Sounds fearsome.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    I chose the smallest chest. I found the item.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He asked me about a woman & a friend.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    Can’t remember

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
Can’t remember

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why? No clue. I was lost much of the time.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice? Not at all.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer? I did. The level was massive. Lots of paths to choose.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you? Not really

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain. Not really. Their comments were always negative no matter what the choice was

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way
- Other:
Tester 11
Pre Play Survey
Age: 25
Gender: Male

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 6-10
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td>![Check]</td>
<td>![Check]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   3 Explore a new area
   1 Defeat an enemy
   2 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   3 The highest score
   1 The most kills
   2 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   3 Recon the area
   2 Capture objectives
1. Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   - 1. Sniper
   - 2. Soldier
   - 3. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   - 3. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   - 2. Finishing a difficult quest
   - 1. Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   - 1. Two levels worth of experience
   - 2. A powerful new weapon
   - 3. Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   - 2. Strong
   - 3. Smart
   - 1. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   - 1. Read the manual
   - 3. Go play online
   - 2. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   - 2. Many different areas
   - 3. Many different quests
   - 1. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
    - 3. Know a secret no one else does
    - 2. Have an item no one else has
    - 1. Defeat an enemy no one else can
Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level? To read more of the dialogue

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not? Yes the humor intrigued me

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not? Sure. The character I played definitely made some choices

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why? Multiple choice, helps me build my character

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why? Depends, sometimes I feel too lost with too many choices. Other times the choices aren’t real.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why? Yes. I know my character and I like to control his story

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones? No, played Gears and Borderlands and Mass Effect

8. What was the story of the level?
Man returns to a place he’s been, and has to fight 3 monsters to get treasure.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   I chose the explodimator, #3. I wanted to see some dudes explode.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The last, I thought I could take all of them for some reason. A portable shower?

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He asked me about what I’d do if a boulder dropped on my friend. He was some kind of crab guy.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He asked me... I forgot. Sorry. He was a big bear. I answered snarkily.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He asked me something about what his senses were. Big dog dude. I blew his head off literally.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
    The one behind the boss. I didn’t see another.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
    Nope.
16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes, but the level maze seemed to always go to the same place

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   Yes, in how early I fought the bosses

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Yes

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

   - Exploration
   - Speed
   - Combat
   - Randomly
   - Believed designer wanted me to go that way
   - Other:

Tester 12
Pre Play Survey

Age: 25

Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? : yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 8

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   1. Explore a new area
   2. Accomplish an important objective
   3. Defeat an enemy

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1. The most kills
   2. The highest score
   3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   1. Capture objectives
   2. Kill enemies
   3. Recon the area

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1. Soldier
   2. Sniper
   3. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1. Discovering a secret treasure vault
3 Finishing a difficult quest  
1 Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
3 Two levels worth of experience  
1 A powerful new weapon  
2 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
1 Strong  
2 Smart  
3 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
3 Read the manual  
1 Go play online  
2 Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
1 Many different areas  
3 Many different quests  
2 Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
3 Know a secret no one else does  
1 Have an item no one else has  
2 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?  
   To see what I would find next

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
Yes I thought the story was funny, and I wanted to see what was next.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not? No, the characters were so funny that’s why.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why? Aren’t all the answers the same anyway? Without.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why? I like to go one direction - without.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why? No because I feel like I never really do control the story.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones? Yes, a number of Bioware games.

8. What was the story of the level? To find the treasure.


10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive? The one on the left.
11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He was a giant blue sea creature who asked about strength.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He was a tiny dog who asked about friendships.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He was a bear.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   I always go right - right.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Not really.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
    In what ways did you or didn’t you?
    Not really. I felt like I would always fight.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
    Yes.
19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

☐ Exploration
☐ Speed
☐ Combat
☐ Randomly
☒ Believed designer wanted me to go that way
☐ Other:

Tester 13
Pre Play Survey
Age: 26
Gender: F

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Ok.

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 4

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)
1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   3 Defeat an enemy
   2 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   2 The highest score
   1 The most kills
   3 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   1 Recon the area
   3 Capture objectives
   2 Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1 Sniper
   2 Soldier
   3 Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1 Discovering a secret treasure vault
   2 Finishing a difficult quest
   3 Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   1 Two levels worth of experience
   3 A powerful new weapon
   2 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   3 Strong
   1 Smart
   2 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   2 Read the manual
1. Go play online
3. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

1. Many different areas
3. Many different quests
2. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

2. Know a secret no one else does
1. Have an item no one else has
3. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   To kill everything in my way.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Maybe? Killing all the enemies was a treat.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Not really I couldn’t tell what was wanted of me.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   Multiple choices. More choices means more chances that I can choose something that I might say.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
With multiple paths. See the game world differently each playthrough.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story?
   Why?
   Sure. To see how many choices effect the game.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to
   Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Not too much. Also, no.

8. What was the story of the level?
   To see if I could get to the treasure by beating bad guys.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good
   choice?
   The second one. It killed things... So it was good

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did
    you receive?
    The tiny box. Also, it was a portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk
    about?
    Asked me what strength was. He was a bug and he talked about
    boulders.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk
    about?
    Courage? He was a rotting bear who asked me about chicks and
    jealousy.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk
    about?
About tasting things. A puppy and I have no idea.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The one on the furthest left. No idea.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
    No. I shot everything.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
    I figured I would end up going where I was needed to go.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
    In what ways did you or didn’t you?
    No. All the enemies would try to kill me regardless.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
    No. I don’t know what they wanted.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

   - Exploration
   - Speed
   - Combat
   - Randomly
   - Believed designer wanted me to go that way
   - Other:

   □ Other:
Tester 14
Pre Play Survey
Age: 30

Gender: Male

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 10

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

- Action
- Adventure
- Strategy
- Puzzle
- FPS
- RPG
- Simulation
- Platformer
- MMO
- Sports
- Rhythm
- Casual

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

1. Would you rather:
   - 1 Explore a new area
   - 3 Defeat an enemy
   - 2 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   - 1 The highest score
   - 2 The most kills
   - 3 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Recon the area</td>
<td>1 Capture objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Kill enemies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Would you rather play as a:</td>
<td>2 Sniper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Soldier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Scout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. For you, which is most exciting?</td>
<td>1 Discovering a secret treasure vault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Finishing a difficult quest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Defeating a powerful boss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:</td>
<td>2 Two levels worth of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 A powerful new weapon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Access to a new area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Would you rather be:</td>
<td>3 Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Smart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Wealthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. If you just bought a game, would you first:</td>
<td>2 Read the manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Go play online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Check out the game’s achievements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-</td>
<td>2 Many different areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing Game (MMO):</td>
<td>1 Many different quests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Many different enemies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Would you rather:</td>
<td>1 Know a secret no one else does</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3 Have an item no one else has
2 Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   I wanted to figure out where the story was going, and indeed if it made any sense.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   I was expecting some kind of joke ending. I was interested in learning the “punchline” to what came before.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Not really. The dialogue options seemed to lead inevitably to combat anyway.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With. Done well, it creates a sense of identity for the player character, allowing the player to have a personalized experience of the story. Additionally, done well, it allows for meaningful choices that allow the player to affect outcomes.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   With, as they can provide meaningful choices if done correctly. Done poorly, they are just extra space.
6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Yes. In the absence of such control, the player becomes more of a passive and less of a participant.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes. Yes. Mass Effect (+2), Baldur’s Gate, Kotor, Dragon Age, etc

8. What was the story of the level?
   A hermit believed I was a ghost and promised me riches deep in the cave if I could best three great beasts. The beasts questioned me re: strength, courage, and perception, each attacking me after I answered. At the end I received a key, opening my choice of three locked objects to open, which contained the most valuable treasure in the wasteland

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The Fist of God, because anything named such has to be good. It seemed fine, but in the absence of a comparison it was kind of meaningless

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The safe, because safes guard the most valuable things. I received a portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    The first guardian was a giant murlock, and he asked me about the nature of strength, in the form of impressing women and rescuing friends trapped under boulders. Then he attacked me
12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
The second guardian was a giant mutant bear. He told the story of a master escape artist and Stephan Boroel, and asked me the meaning of courage. Then he attacked me.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
The third guardian was a giant dog. He asked me how he perceived my presence, after claiming to be blind, deaf, and unable to smell. Then he attacked me.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
The “hard” door, just to see if it affected anything.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Nope

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   I felt like I had choices, and they were contextless and did not seem to make a difference.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   No. The guardians always attacked, the paths all led to the same place without changing anything.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
They always attacked. Without context, such as indications as to their feelings on the relevant subject, their responses seemed random.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly (only when there is no other info on which to base the decision)
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other:

Tester 15
Pre Play Survey

Age: 25
Gender: M
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 10-15
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

- Action
- Adventure
- Strategy
- Puzzle
- FPS
- RPG
- Simulation
- Platformer
- MMO
- Sports
- Rhythm
- Casual
Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Would you rather:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Explore a new area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Defeat an enemy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Accomplish an important objective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 The highest score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The most kills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 A good strategy for the next match</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Recon the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Capture objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Kill enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Would you rather play as a:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Sniper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Soldier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Scout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5. For you, which is most exciting?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Discovering a secret treasure vault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Finishing a difficult quest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Defeating a powerful boss</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 Two levels worth of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A powerful new weapon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Access to a new area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7. Would you rather be:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 Strong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   1. Read the manual
   2. Go play online
   3. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   1. Many different areas
   2. Many different quests
   3. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
    1. Know a secret no one else does
    2. Have an item no one else has
    3. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   I wanted to see what would happen later on. The monster encounters were interesting.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   I forgot the main crux of the story. I was more interested in what the monsters

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Yes, to a point. I didn’t like the overarching story as much as the monster “guardians”
4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?  
   I like dialogue PROVIDED I can save to explore all the different options.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?  
   I like multiple paths because I like to explore. I want to be able to see all there is and feel like I’m exploring.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?  
   Yes. I like thinking that what I am doing has and influence on the game.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?  
   Yes, played Fallout + Morrowind

8. What was the story of the level?  
   Find the treasure.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?  
   The 3rd one. I wanted to make the bad guys explode. It was ok. It worked. But the guys didn’t explode.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?  
    The middle one because it was the smallest. I don’t remember the treasure.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
HE asked me about strength. He wanted to know about my thoughts on strength. He was a giant crab thing.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He asked about Morlun and courage. He was a giant bear thing.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   He asked how did he perceive me. He was a dog. He talked about losing hearing, sight, and smell.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The hard one because I wanted a challenge

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   No

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   There were always choices but they all felt like they led to the same result.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   No, I didn’t. The paths all led to the same place and the guardian questions all seemed to nonsensical to have a right answer.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
When I actually tried to answer, NO. When I wanted to make them mad, then YES.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Other:

Tester 16

Pre Play Survey
Age: 27
Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 8

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

- Action
- Adventure
- Strategy
- Puzzle
- FPS
- RPG
- Simulation
- Platformer
- MMO
- Sports
- Rhythm
- Casual

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)
1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   2 Defeat an enemy
   3 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   3 The highest score
   1 The most kills
   2 A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   2 Recon the area
   3 Capture objectives
   1 Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   2 Sniper
   1 Soldier
   3 Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1 Discovering a secret treasure vault
   3 Finishing a difficult quest
   2 Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   3 Two levels worth of experience
   2 A powerful new weapon
   1 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   2 Strong
   1 Smart
   3 Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
2. Read the manual
1. Go play online
3. Check out the game's achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

1. Many different areas
2. Many different quests
3. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

1. Know a secret no one else does
3. Have an item no one else has
2. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   I enjoyed the riddles, even when they seemed ridiculous

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Yes. I wanted to see if I could identify a motivation behind the guarding beings.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   The story, like the dialogue, was pretty nebulous. I was immersed, but also confused.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   Without.
5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   It depends. I like multiple paths, but I am very thorough about exploring all of them so it can be taxing to backtrack.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   Not fully control. I like to believe that a game’s overall arc, much like fate, has a general direction, and that I play a small but meaningful part of it.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   Yes. Morrowind, Mass Effect, Baldur’s Gate

8. What was the story of the level?
   A naïve character is thrust into some sort of fable world, and navigates through a series of riddles.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The fissure of the breach. The frost weapon sounded uninteresting, and I was scared of the world-ending gun.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    I chose the most modest looking chest; I received a portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   Mirelurk. He told a story about an immortal man, and asked me whether I thought he was brave. He asked about the definition of bravery.
12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   The second guardian was a bear. He asked how I would respond if a friend and I both fancied the same woman. He also asked how I would respond if my friend were pinned under a boulder.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   A wolf who asked me to guess how he had detected me.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   Normal, I’m a normal guy. I like some challenge.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Not really. I was not going out of my way to kill things.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   I feel like three choices makes enough variety in most cases.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   I suspect that maybe they would have hated all my answers, but I can’t know without replaying.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Not always. They seemed to be pretty intelligent while presenting the riddles, but reckless once I answered,
19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way
- Other: I try to devise which path the designer intended for, and then explore all the others, leaving it for last

Tester 17
Pre Play Survey
Age: 23
Gender: Male

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 30

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   Defeat an enemy
   Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1 The highest score
   The most kills
   A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   Recon the area
   1 Capture objectives
   Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   Sniper
   Soldier
   1 Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1 Discovering a secret treasure vault
   Finishing a difficult quest
   Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   Two levels worth of experience
   A powerful new weapon
   1 Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
   Strong
   1 Smart
   Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   Read the manual
1 Go play online
   Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):
   1 Many different areas
      Many different quests
      Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:
    1 Know a secret no one else does
        Have an item no one else has
        Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
   I wanted to see what I could find.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   Yes. The guy at the beginning was crazy and I wanted to see what was actually going on in the caves.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   Not really. I wasn’t sure what the overarching story was with the creatures talking to me.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   With. I allows me to often roleplay my character as acting in a particular way.
5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why? With because I like to have a space with room to explore and discover things.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why? Yes because I like to roleplay my character and to have those actions impact the outcome.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones? Yes. Fallout 3 and the Elder Scrolls series in particular.

8. What was the story of the level? I remember the crazy old man asking me about being a ghost and calling me liege. But I’m not sure how this connected with the creatures.


10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive? The actual treasure chest because treasure is “supposed” to come in chests. Portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about? He seemed to be asking me riddles almost. He was a mirelurk and was asking about boulders and women.
12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   I don’t remember what he asked me or really talked about. It was a bear.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
   The third guardian asked me about his senses. He was a wolf. He talked about how bad all his senses were.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
   The left one because it seemed to be off the critical path.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Not really.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out?
   In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   It seemed like answering the questions correctly might have allowed me to pass the guardians without fighting. I failed (?) them all and ended no killing them all.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   The animal seemed to have different values in mind out since they aren’t human it didn’t seem unnatural.
19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way

☑ Other: I try to fully explore every path

Tester 18
Pre Play Survey
Age: 25
Gender: M

Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: yes

How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 8

What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>☑ Action</th>
<th>☑ Adventure</th>
<th>☑ Strategy</th>
<th>☑ Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑ FPS</td>
<td>☑ RPG</td>
<td>☑ Simulation</td>
<td>☑ Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ MMO</td>
<td>☑ Sports</td>
<td>☑ Rhythm</td>
<td>☑ Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Player Profiling – Rate the three options for each question, writing 1 through 3 next to them (1 being highest, 3 being lowest)
1. Would you rather:
   1. Explore a new area
   2. Accomplish an important objective
   3. Defeat an enemy

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1. The most kills
   2. The highest score
   3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   1. Kill enemies
   2. Capture objectives
   3. Recon the area

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1. Soldier
   2. Sniper
   3. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1. Defeating a powerful boss
   2. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   3. Finishing a difficult quest

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   1. Access to a new area
   2. A powerful new weapon
   3. Two levels worth of experience

7. Would you rather be:
   1. Strong
   2. Smart
   3. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   1. Read the manual
   2. Play
   3. Explore
1. Go play online
2. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

1. Many different areas
3. Many different quests
2. Many different enemies

10. Would you rather:

3. Know a secret no one else does
1. Have an item no one else has
2. Defeat an enemy no one else can

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?

   Getting to the end and finding the treasure.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?

   Not really, because the levels were pretty much mindless run and shoot scenarios that didn’t further the story along the way through gameplay.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?

   Not really because while it was somewhat humorous it was usually really long-winded, which caused me to lose interest quite soon.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?

   With because it makes me feel like I am at least somewhat controlling the outcome of the story.
5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?

With if the gameplay warrants such things—each path is either unique and fun or just fun wherever I go. If each branching path is the same in terms of gameplay, then I see no reason to have multiple paths—unless the gameplay is just that fun or the player must collect something unique along each path.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?

Yes, because I will become more invested in the game if I feel like I am controlling the outcome of its story.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?

Yes. Yes—*Elder Scrolls 4: Oblivion*

8. What was the story of the level?

You play as whatever you choose from the initial dialogue and are to venture deep inside the cave to find some “great” treasure.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?

I chose the gun that was supposed to blow the enemies apart. Because I wanted to see the enemies get blown apart. No, the weapon felt like a standard AK weapon and I would occasionally see body part fly off—maybe that was the intended effect? The dialogue built it up to seem much more impressive.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
The one that resembled a safe because it was closest to my character, seemed like a good enough choice, and possibly because it was the biggest—though based off the previous path choices it didn’t really seem to matter which one I chose. I received a portable shower.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

Something about my friend being crushed by a rock and being asked to be left behind as he would only be half a friend if I tried to save him.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

Something about an escape artist and a prison.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

Something about this giant dog and who he was?

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?

No

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?

No

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
Where to go, yes. What to answer, no.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?

No

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.

It seemed like the scenarios were always going to end in bloodshed, but I think that was mainly because I probably would have killed them off regardless of the outcome. Also, the dialogue seemed always end in failure anyways, but would have to play through each situation to make a definitive answer.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way
- Other:

Tester 19

Pre Play Survey
Age: 25
Gender: M
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: Y
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 8
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

- Action
- Adventure
- Strategy
- Puzzle
1. Would you rather:
   1. Accomplish an important objective
   2. Explore a new area
   3. Defeat an enemy

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1. The most kills
   2. The highest score
   3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   1. Kill enemies
   2. Recon the area
   3. Capture objectives

4. Would you rather play as a:
   1. Scout
   2. Sniper
   3. Soldier

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1. Defeating a powerful boss
   2. Finishing a difficult quest
   3. Discovering a secret treasure vault

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   1. Access to a new area
   2. Two levels worth of experience
   3. A powerful new weapon

7. Would you rather be:
   1. Smart
   2. Strong
   3. Wealthy

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:
   1. Read the manual
   2. Go play online
   3. Check out the game’s achievements

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-
Playing Game (MMO):
| 2 Many different areas  |
| 1 Many different quests |
| 3 Many different enemies |

10. Would you rather:
| 3 Know a secret no one else does |
| 1 Have an item no one else has |
| 2 Defeat an enemy no one else can |

Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?
Winning

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?
   
   Not really, it made no sense.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?
   No. The story seemed arbitrary. It never tied in with itself.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?
   Depends on how well the dialogue choices are done.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?
   Without. Multiple paths make me afraid that I have missed something. Leaving the main path is like a flashback in a movie, even if it is cool, it is always a little disappointing to stop moving forward in the main story.
6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?
   I prefer games where I have an impact on the story because it gives my actions a bit more weight and consequently a bit more emotional impact.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?
   I have played fallout 3 before. I suppose daggerfall (an early game in the elder scrolls series) is similar.

8. What was the story of the level?
   I was a ghost? Maybe I was escaping my tomb? There were things asking me questions.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   I chose the ice queen. This was actually fairly effective as all of the weapons were probably the same, but the weapon I chose was accurate and deadly so I was happy with it.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    By this time I felt that the choice was probably totally arbitrary so I picked the biggest one. I got the best treasure in the wasteland.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    He was a big crab thing. I forget exactly what he talked about.
12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

He was a wolf thing. He told a story about courage. He asked questions about courage.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

He was a wolf. He was asking about his senility I think.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?

No

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?

No

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?

No

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?

No, the answers did not seem to have a bearing on responses etc.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.

Not totally. I got the feeling that whatever I answered I was going to get in a fight.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

☐ Exploration
Believed designer wanted me to go that way

Tester 20
Pre Play Survey
Age: 41
Gender: M
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”?: yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 24
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Would you rather:
   - Explore a new area 1
   - Defeat an enemy 3
   - Accomplish an important objective 2

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   - The highest score 3
   - The most kills 2
   - A good strategy for the next match 1

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   - Recon the area 1
   - Capture objectives 2
   - Kill enemies 3

4. Would you rather play as a:
   - Sniper 3
   - Soldier 2
   - Scout 1

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   - Discovering a secret treasure vault 1
### Post-Play Survey

1. What was your motivation for completing the level?

   The treasure.

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?

   No. It just a single treasure out of three you can choose.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Preference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finishing a difficult quest</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defeating a powerful boss</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two levels worth of experience</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A powerful new weapon</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to a new area</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7. Would you rather be:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smart</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wealthy</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8. If you just bought a game, would you first:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read the manual</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Go play online</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check out the game’s achievements</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many different areas</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many different quests</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many different enemies</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>10. Would you rather:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know a secret no one else does</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have an item no one else has</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defeat an enemy no one else can</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
No. The riddles given by the bosses seem shallow.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?

Depends on the game. Mostly no, I just want to collect items and complete missions/quests.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?

With multiple paths. Linear games are generally boring. If stuck on one path, can go to another path and try the previous path again.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?

Yes. Multiple stories can make the gameplay last longer.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?

No. no.

8. What was the story of the level?

To find treasure by any means necessary.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?

God gun. Sounded like an all purpose gun. Yes.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?

The safe. Picked it caused it looked like it had the most treasure. Ammo and other artillery stuff (as I recall).
11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

A riddle about a friend trapped under a boulder. A giant insect (similar to scorpion or cockroach). Friendship.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

A girl my friend and we wanted to marry. A bearlike creature. What I would do to get the girl and keep my friend from getting her.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

About an escape artist who can escape any trap and another who tried to stop him. A dog like creature. Courage.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?

No.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?

No.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?

Yes.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?

No. No matter how I answered the question the guardian would answer the same.
18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.

Not sure.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

☐ Exploration
☐ Speed
☐ Combat
☐ Randomly
☐ Believed designer wanted me to go that way
☐ Other:

What was

**Tester 21**

Pre Play Survey

Age: 25
Gender: M
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Y
How many hours per week do you play videogames (pre-Guildhall)? 15
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

|☐ Action |☐ Adventure | x Strategy |☐ Puzzle |
|☐ FPS | x RPG |☐ Simulation |☐ Platformer |
|☐ MMO |☐ Sports |☐ Rhythm |☐ Casual |

1. Would you rather:
   1 Explore a new area
   2 Defeat an enemy
   3 Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1 The highest score
   2 The most kills
   3 A good strategy for the next match
3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Recon the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Capture objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kill enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Would you rather play as a:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Sniper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Soldier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Scout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. For you, which is most exciting?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Discovering a secret treasure vault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Finishing a difficult quest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Defeating a powerful boss</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Two levels worth of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A powerful new weapon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Access to a new area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Would you rather be:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Smart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Wealthy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Read the manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Go play online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Check out the game’s achievements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Many different areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Many different quests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Many different enemies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. Would you rather:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Know a secret no one else does</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Have an item no one else has</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Defeat an enemy no one else can</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post-Play Survey
1. your motivation for completing the level?

Finding the treasure of course!

2. Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?

   I was. I wanted to be able to use this weapon of mass destruction. The dialogue was also very well written and made me want to encounter more interesting characters.

3. Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?

   Yes. Good dialogue definitely helped. The intro conversation was witty and entertaining.

4. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices? Why?

   I prefer them. I always feel choice is important in games. Sometimes I would replay an entire game just to redo a lot of my choices a.k.a. Oblivian, or the Witcher.

5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?

   I prefer them. Again choice is important for replay value.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why? Feel more a part of the story. I also feel more in control of my destiny and maybe other character’s destinies.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?

   Yes, Oblivian was my favorite. The Witcher had lots of dialogue and player choice. Stalker was similar as well.

8. What was the story of the level?
Well the explicit story was about the quest for treasure. The treasure was acquired primarily through mental and moral decisions rather than combat (last resort).

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?
   The second one

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?
    The one in the black box. I didn’t put much through into my selection. Was disappointed that I had to kill the old dog. The big black box probably first caught my eye thus I went for it.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    Trying to remember I think it was about if a boulder fell on your friend what would you do… save him, let him die and something else… (the dialogue was selected before I could read all the options)

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    About courage.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
    A woman you and your friend both were passionately in love with.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?
    I think they had numbers on them, but it’s a little hazy.
15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?
   Yes because I had just failed at the courage test, so it made me feel obliged to prove that bastard wrong.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?
   Yes, the choices on where to go, I thought, were a little overwhelming at times. I liked the dialogue choices a lot, although I would have liked more time to read them.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?
   Not particularly, I didn’t get any answers correct, so by the end of the third

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
   Not sure. The first guardian was a flop, but the others I didn’t get any answers correct so the third guardian I thought I had the correct response, but maybe I wasn’t getting the thing they were testing for.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

   x Exploration
   x Speed
   x Combat
   x Randomly
   x Believed designer wanted me to go that way
   x Other: Loot
Tester 22
Pre Play Survey
Age: 23
Gender: Male
Do you consider yourself a “gamer”? Yes
How many hours per week do you play videogames? 10
*If attending Guildhall, think prior to Guildhall
What are your favorite game genres? (select all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Adventure</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Puzzle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>RPG</td>
<td>Simulation</td>
<td>Platformer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMO</td>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Casual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Would you rather:
   1. Explore a new area
   3. Defeat an enemy
   2. Accomplish an important objective

2. In a multiplayer game, would you rather have:
   1. The highest score
   2. The most kills
   3. A good strategy for the next match

3. In a team-based multiplayer game, would you prefer to:
   2. Recon the area
   1. Capture objectives
   3. Kill enemies

4. Would you rather play as a:
   2. Sniper
   1. Soldier
   3. Scout

5. For you, which is most exciting?
   1. Discovering a secret treasure vault
   3. Finishing a difficult quest
   2. Defeating a powerful boss

6. As a quest reward, would you prefer:
   2. Two levels worth of experience
   3. A powerful new weapon
   1. Access to a new area

7. Would you rather be:
### 8. If you just bought a game, would you first:

- **2** Read the manual
- **1** Go play online
- **3** Check out the game’s achievements

### 9. What would most attract you to a Massive Multiplayer Online Role-Playing Game (MMO):

- **2** Many different areas
- **1** Many different quests
- **3** Many different enemies

### 10. Would you rather:

- **1** Know a secret no one else does
- **3** Have an item no one else has
- **2** Defeat an enemy no one else can

---

**Post-Play Survey**

1. **What was your motivation for completing the level?**

   I continued to follow the path and I wanted to complete the story.

2. **Were you interested in the outcome of the story? Why or why not?**

   Yeh, overall the story seemed to be pretty well written, although I was a little confused about the choices. It seemed like whatever I choose was wrong.

3. **Would you say you were immersed in the story? Why or why not?**

   Yes, I was immersed. I particularly liked the choices and the consequences of the decisions.

4. **Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple dialogue choices?**

   I prefer games with multiple dialogue choices.
5. Generally, do you prefer games with or without multiple path choices? Why?

I prefer games with multiple path choices due to the fact that it makes me feel as if my choices change the game in some way.

6. Generally, do you prefer games in which you can control the story? Why?

Yes, I prefer games with a story I can control because it is more dynamic and believable.

7. Have you played Fallout 3 before? Have you played games similar to Fallout 3 before? If so, which ones?

Yes, I have played Fallout 3 and other similar games such as Oblivion and Mass Effect 1 and 2 (dialogue choices)

8. What was the story of the level?

Essentially there were these three monsters that asked me questions and I was supposed to answer them correctly in order to pass through the gauntlet.

9. Which of the guns did you choose? Why? Did you feel you made a good choice?

I choose the last gun (don’t remember the name). I successfully conquered my foes so yeh I feel like I made a good choice but I have no way of knowing what the other two were.

10. Which of the treasure chests did you pick and why? What treasure did you receive?

The middle one, randomly. I received the shower head.

11. What did the first guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?
I believe the first guardian asked me about the bolder on the man. He was a mer...something...I forgot the name, but it is a sea creature type thing.

12. What did the second guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

The second guardian asked me about wooing this woman and the friend wanting to do the same thing. He was a big bear or something.

13. What did the third guardian ask you? Who was he and what did he talk about?

The third guardian asked how he heard my presence in the room. He was a wolf.

14. Did you notice a difference between the doors on the second floor? If so, which of the doors did you pick on the second floor and why?

I do not remember seeing a difference between the doors on the second floor.

15. Did you notice a change in the difficulty of the game resulting in your door choice?

No.

16. During the course of the level, did you feel like you had plenty of choices of where to go and what to answer?

Yes.

17. Did you feel like you had an impact on the way the story would play out? In what ways did you or didn’t you?

I’m not sure, I kind of feel like whatever choice I made would be negative so in a way I felt like there were limited choices.

18. When you answered the guardians’ questions, did you feel they responded appropriately given what your answer was? If not, explain.
No, I felt like my choice was logical and they simply would say nope, wrong and that would be the end of it. I would have liked some more feedback.

19. Typically in games, if there are multiple paths how do you decide which path to follow? (check all that apply)

- Exploration
- Speed
- Combat
- Randomly
- Believed designer wanted me to go that way
- Other: Depends on the story paths.

---

\[i\] \url{http://www.gamedaily.com/articles/news/fable-ii-sells-26-million-future-dlc-confirmed/}
\[ii\] \url{http://www.variety.com/review/VE1117938784.html?categoryid=1079&cs=1}
\[iii\] \url{http://www.oxmonline.com/article/reviews/xbox-360/a-f/fable-ii}
\[iv\] \url{http://www.gamingnexus.com/Article/Fable-2/Item2038.aspx}
\[v\] \url{http://www.gamepro.com/article/reviews/212803/dragon-age-origins/}